
H-France Review Vol. 21 (December 2021) No. 223

Yves Krumenacker and Philippe Martin, eds., *Jésuites et protestantism XVIe-XXIe siècles*. Chrétiens et Sociétés. Documents et mémoires no 37. Lyon, Laboratoire de recherche historique Rhône-Alpes, 2019. 360 pp. Figures, notes, bibliography, and index. €20.00. (pb). ISBN 9791091592246.

Review by Jill Fehleison, Quinnipiac University.

This collection is the publication of eighteen papers presented at a colloquium in Lyon in 2018. The chapters in the first section, “L’ancienne Compagnie,” examine a variety of engagements between Jesuits and Protestants, mostly Reformed, primarily in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The second section, “La nouvelle Compagnie,” explores the Jesuits and Protestants from the nineteenth through the twenty-first centuries after the Order’s revival in 1814. The first section primarily focuses on what occurred in France, but the second section expands into the Russian Empire and Africa in the nineteenth century.

The premise of the collection of papers is that the Society of Jesus should be explored alongside their Protestant adversaries. The editors’ introduction notes that Loyola’s *Spiritual Exercises* always had broader appeal, such as with the Anglicans in the nineteenth century. Polemics are a critical part of the Jesuit *raison d’être*, and as the editors note, the Jesuits were the Protestants’ “other.” The two confessions existed in a common culture, and while their encounters were often based on conflict, their interactions were not always adversarial.

These essays support the growing scholarship of Western Christianity arguing that we better understand Catholics and Protestants when we look at how they engaged with each other. Ignatius Loyola established his Order in part to engage with his religious rivals, so it makes sense to examine how Catholics and Protestants interacted with one another. The volume is particularly interested in the written exchanges that took place in print between the confessions. This review will not address all eighteen chapters, but it will highlight important themes that run through many of the essays.

An important theme that runs through many of the chapters is that Protestants and Jesuits interacted on a regular basis in a variety of ways. Some level of cooperation including face-to-face debates, written interactions, and occasional collaboration was more likely when both the Jesuits and Protestants found themselves as minority communities. Kandakou noted this in the Russian Empire in the nineteenth century and Prudhomme found cooperation in sub-Saharan Africa and Madagascar in the twentieth century.

Alain Cullière explores how both Protestants and other Catholics, in this case the Gallicans, challenged the Jesuits in print. Étienne Pasquier, the legal scholar and Royal official to Henri III, and Jean Chassanion, a Reformed minister, published against the Jesuits, portraying them as dangerous to the country and having more loyalty to Rome than to France. Jesuits were often portrayed by their adversaries as foreign threats. Chassanion's work was published in Geneva in 1592, a center for publishing anti-Jesuit works in the 1580s and 1590s. According to Cullière, Pasquier and Chassanion differed in what they viewed as most dangerous about the Jesuits, with Protestant Chassanion seeing their beliefs and practices as erroneous while Gallican Pasquier was more concerned with the Order's challenges to the monarchy.

Since both the Jesuits and the Reformed movement were evangelical, both groups sent out missionaries and sought conversions. Sometimes they succeeded. Pierre Antoine Fabre examines the conversion of Jesuits to the Reformed faith in the sixteenth century. As he notes, both faiths were on "la frontière confessionnelle," so their interactions and influence were not always predictable (p. 42). Being in close proximity to other confessions seems to have heightened the chance a member of the other group might defect. Fabre notes that two Jesuits who left the order spent time in a college in Halle, and observes Max Weber's point that personal experience is important to an individual's religious views.

Jesuits and Protestants engaged with each other's works through the centuries, and they continued to read and write about their rival's works. Of particular importance to the Jesuits was John Calvin's *Institutes of the Christian Religion*. Even after his death, Calvin's systematic theology of the Reformed faith remained a critical source for the Jesuits to challenge. Chapters by Sylvio Hermann De Franceschi and Nicolas Guyard both demonstrate how Calvin's works continued to be points of interest for Jesuit polemicists. De Franceschi considers how Jesuits and Protestants viewed various forms of fasting and abstinence. While many Protestant leaders eschewed the necessity of fasting and abstinence, John Calvin supported some forms of fasting, and Reformed Churches called for periods of fasting during crises.[1] De Franceschi notes that Loyola himself did not prioritize fasting in the same way as later Jesuits like Robert Bellarmine. Guyard examines the continued influence of Calvin's writings on the conflict over relics between the Huguenots and Jesuits in France.

Fabienne Henryot charts the dramatic increase in anti-Protestant polemics on the part of the Jesuits in the first decades of the seventeenth century. The polemical battles between Jesuits and Protestant could be intense, and two chapters in particular remind us that both sides were willing to resort to falsehoods, rumors, and satire to undermine their opponents. Julian Léonard explores how a Protestant minister Samuel des Marest used these methods to attack the Jesuits of Maastricht in the 1630s. Stefano Simiz examines the creation of letters falsely attributed to Calvin by the Jesuit Louis Sevestre in 1650, demonstrating the lengths this Jesuit went to discredit the Reformed faith.

Yves Krumenacker explores how Pierre Bayle's personal experiences with the Jesuits shaped the entry for Ignatius Loyola in his *Dictionnaire historique et critique*. Bayle converted to Catholicism while at the Jesuit College of Toulouse, but he soon adjured Catholicism and fled to Geneva. According to Krumenacker, after Bayle's rejection of Catholicism he was ambivalent about the Jesuits, admiring the founder Ignatius Loyola but viewing the Order as full of fanaticism and superstition. Bayle was especially critical of the Jesuits' role in the persecution of French Protestants.

Several of the chapters focus on the role the Jesuits played in education, an important sphere of influence that the Jesuits fought to maintain throughout the Order's history. Simona Negruzzo examines the confrontation in sixteenth-century Strasbourg between the gymnasium established by Protestant Jean Sturm and the Jesuit colleges established in the Holy Roman Empire. Phillippe Rocher looks at the Jesuit efforts to challenge the social and political changes happening in the nineteenth century, including pushing back against Jules Ferry's laws for secular education.

From the establishment of the Jesuits, the Order has been linked to missionary work and to European colonialism. Catholic missionaries who first arrived in the Americas and in Asia were free from Protestant rivals. Jesuit missionaries in the nineteenth century had competition from Protestants, particularly in Africa. Claude Prudhomme notes that in the Congo and Madagascar Protestant missionaries campaigned against the mistreatment of the native populations. In turn, the Jesuits accused the Protestants of "de servir les intérêts de l'étranger" (p. 293). In the view of Protestant missionaries, the Jesuits exploited native populations and supported colonialism. Yet the rivals made unofficial agreements to stay away from the other's zone of influence. Prudhomme finds that diaries reveal that the two groups would behave as neighbors, coming to each other's aid during times of illness or injury. Despite some practical cooperation, however, the official polemical stance of the Jesuits was that of viewing the "le peril protestant" (p. 299). More primary source work would provide a clearer picture of the relations between the two groups.

The final chapters explore more contemporary issues. At the end of World War II, the relationship between the two religious groups shifted and there were increased efforts for ecumenicalism. In the second half of the twentieth century, moreover, both Catholic and Protestant missionaries became caught up in decolonization. Olivier Chatelan reviews the mostly positive Protestant views of Pope Francis's election. Michel Fédou introduces several Jesuit twentieth-century theologians and their efforts at greater ecumenicalism. Both Christophe Chalamet and Michel Fédou demonstrate how Jesuit theologians recognized the importance of Karl Barth to modern Christian theology. Rémi de Mainderville notes the lack of exploration of Protestantism in the *revue Christus*, the journal of French Jesuits.

This collection of essays demonstrates in numerous ways how the Jesuits were often intertwined with politics. Whether it was their presence in contested places during the sixteenth century, their close ties to Henri IV of France, or their presence in Africa and ties to colonialism in the late nineteenth century, Jesuits have been engaged with Protestants and the wider world from their establishment in 1540. This collection demonstrates that once scholars move beyond the grand narrative of the Society of Jesus, like most other religious institutions, there are complexities and local situations that shape its history. Many of the chapters are introductions to published primary sources, and there are many untouched avenues that would certainly deepen our understanding of the many facets to the relationship between the Jesuits and Protestants through the centuries. The volume is most useful to scholars who possess a good understanding of the history of the Jesuits. There is an electronic version of the volume available on *Open Edition Books* that will allow those interested to explore the chapters most useful for their areas of expertise.

LISTS OF ESSAYS

L'ancienne compagnie

Alain Cullière, “Gallicans et protestants contre les jésuites au XVI^e siècle: Les « leçons » d’Étienne Pasquier et de Jean Chassanion”

Pierre Antoine Fabre, “La conversion à la Réforme dans la première Compagnie de Jésus”
Simona Negruzzo, “Les Jésuites nous secondent’: La confrontation pédagogique entre protestants et catholiques dans le Strasbourg du xvie siècle”

Sylvio Hermann De Franceschi, “La morale catholique posttridentine et la controverse interconfessionnelle: Jeûne et abstinence dans la confrontation entre protestants et jésuites : privations alimentaires et confessionnalisation”

Fabienne Henryot, “Publier la controverse (1598-1629) : Les jésuites et l’édition de la théologie antiprotestante”

Julien Léonard, “Le faux au service de la controverse: Le pasteur Samuel Des Marest face aux jésuites de Maastricht (1632-1636)”

Stefano Simiz, “Louis Sevestre, controversiste jésuite et auteur de (fausses) lettres de Calvin: Le regard d’un compagnon sur les pasteurs réformés dans les années 1650”

Didier Boisson, “Autour de l’application de la déclaration de 1656: Les arguments du jésuite Bernard Meynier et de l’avocat réformé Pierre Loride au début des années 1660”

Nicolas Guyard, “Les Échos de Calvin: Les jésuites, les protestants et les reliques au xvii^e siècle”

Bruno Maes, “L’impact des missions intérieures des jésuites sur les protestants: Jean-François Régis dans le Vivarais à l’époque baroque”

Yves Krumenacker, “Pierre Bayle et Ignace de Loyola”

La nouvelle Compagnie

Dzianis Kandakou, “Jésuites et protestants dans l’Empire de Russie au tournant du xix^e siècle”

Philippe Rocher, “Les Jésuites et « la crise du protestantisme » au xix^e siècle: Du Second Empire à l’affaire Dreyfus”

Christophe Chalamet “Est Deus in nobis? Les premières années du débat Barth-Przywara”

Claude Prudhomme, “Missionnaires jésuites et protestants en Afrique subsaharienne et à Madagascar”

Olivier Chatelan, “Les protestants français et le pape François”

Rémi de Maindreville, “Jésuites et protestants dans la *revue Christus*”

Michel Fédou, “Jésuites et protestants dans la théologie du xx^e siècle”

NOTES

[1] For a fuller discussion of the French Reformed church's approach to fasting see Raymond A. Mentzer "Fasting, Piety, and Political Anxiety among French Reformed Protestants" *Church History* 76/2 (2007): 330-362.

Jill Fehleison
Quinnipiac University
jill.fehleison@quinnipiac.edu

Copyright © 2020 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172