
H-France Review Vol. 21 (August 2021), No. 139

Jeanice Brooks, ed., *Nadia Boulanger and Her World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2020. xvi + 364 pp. Tables, figures, music examples, notes, bibliography, and index. \$105.00 U.S. (cl). ISBN 9780226750682; \$35.00 U.S. (pb). ISBN 9780226750712; \$10.00-\$34.99 U.S. (eb). ISBN 9780226750859.

Review by Jillian C. Rogers, Indiana University-Bloomington.

Nadia Boulanger and Her World, edited by Jeanice Brooks, importantly marks the first Bard Music Festival program and accompanying volume devoted to a woman musician. This book also serves as another indicator of, and participant in, the recent groundswell of Anglophone scholarship on Nadia Boulanger—one of the most dynamic and significant figures in twentieth-century European and US American musical life. Similar to recent monographs such as Brooks's own *The Musical Work of Nadia Boulanger: Performing Past and Future Between the Wars* (2013), Kimberly Francis's *Teaching Stravinsky: Nadia Boulanger and the Consecration of a Modernist Icon* (2015), and my own recent monograph *Resonant Recoveries: French Music and Trauma Between the World Wars* (2021), *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* provides a plethora of new perspectives on Boulanger's life, works, and influence.[1] Moreover, as in other volumes in the Bard Festival'sand His/Her/Their World series, as well as in recent collections of Boulanger primary sources such as *Nadia Boulanger and the Stravinskys: A Selected Correspondence* (2018), edited by Francis, and *Nadia Boulanger: Thoughts on Music* (2020), edited and translated by Brooks and Francis, this collection provides readers with access to many newly-published, fascinating primary sources that further illuminate Boulanger in a variety of contexts.[2]

The primary sources selected for translation and publication in *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* beautifully span authors, media, function, genre, and—perhaps most interestingly—each of these sources' relationships to Boulanger. Annegret Fauser's choice of nineteen submissions from the World War I-era trench magazine *Gazette des Classes du Conservatoire* in response to Boulanger's questionnaire regarding post-war music making, demonstrates Boulanger's prowess as a musical thinker, researcher, ambassador, and editor. Meanwhile, the inclusion of Boulanger's *Carte du Tendre*—her menu of students—from 1935 and Boulanger's letter to Polish musicians after her attendance at the Warsaw Autumn Festival of Contemporary Music in 1956, showcases Boulanger's international reach and influence as a pedagogue, colleague, and cultural ambassador. Boulanger's letters to her mother recounting her travels throughout the United States during her 1925 tour provide an important window into Boulanger's emotional life as she negotiated a new environment as well as her professional status as organist, conductor, a cultural ambassador, and a lecturer in her non-native language of English. The source called “The Beethoven Lectures for the Longy School” sheds light on the multi-faceted and international

training, experience, and prowess that Boulanger held as a music analyst. Finally, two of the most touching and interesting primary sources in this volume, May Sarton's poems for Nadia Boulanger and a letter composed by Boulanger's Polish student Zygmunt Mycielski, reveal the depth of love, respect, and admiration Boulanger's students and followers felt for her.

Each primary source included in this volume is presented with a nuanced and informative contextualization. In addition to providing thoughtful commentary and biographical and cultural details, these source contextualizations also address problematic aspects of the sources themselves, such as Nadia Boulanger's racialized descriptions of the Black US Americans she encountered during her 1925 tour. Brooks's and Gayle Murchison's introduction and afterword, respectively, to Boulanger's 1925 letters furnish readers with tools to interpret Boulanger's words and experience as communicated in her letters, while also, importantly, as Murchison so beautifully puts it, asking "questions about the sources and what they *do not tell* or what they *do not do*" (p. 172, italics original). As Murchison articulates at the outset of her afterword, "what is absent in Boulanger's account reveals far more about her trip, and what she might have seen or learned or experienced, than what she actually describes in her postcards and letters home to her mother" (p. 172). Indeed, as Murchison demonstrates, Boulanger's correspondence with her mother leaves historians with questions regarding how aware Boulanger may have been of moving in segregated spaces during her tour, or whether she visited any historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs) or met any of the many prominent Black classical musicians who were active in the US during the time of her tour. At the same time, however, Boulanger's correspondence sheds light on how her French cultural upbringing shaped her take on race relations in the United States, resulting in an exoticization of the Black US Americans she encountered as well as sympathy for the way Black Americans were treated and a distaste for segregation and discrimination.

Similarly, the essays featured in *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* proffer a wide range of illuminating assessments and interpretations of myriad aspects of Boulanger's milieu, personal life, and career. Alexandra Laederich, Jeanice Brooks, and Kimberly Francis shed light on Boulanger's still unperformed operatic collaboration with her friend and lover Raoul Pugno, *La ville morte*, in essays that take political and socio-cultural circumstances, gender, and Boulanger's and Pugno's personalities and relationship into consideration. Brooks and Francis, for instance, draw on Boulanger's personal commentary in her daybooks on her working and personal relationship with Pugno in order to provide a provocative and compelling analysis of one of *La ville morte's* arias--the tragic female character Héb e's "Vous me voyez." Utilizing their knowledge of Boulanger's, Pugno's, and the composer Claude Debussy's understandings of modal musical techniques as coded as feminine (versus tonal music's masculine associations) Brooks and Francis present a feminist reading of H eb e's aria, illustrating that "Boulanger and Pugno played with Debussyan techniques to infuse their lead woman role with depth and complexity, giving her access to both fear and strength and landing her in a place controlled by her self-determination" (p. 48).

This volume's articles offer significant historiographical corrections and elaborations to numerous narratives that have been constructed around Nadia Boulanger. Marie Duch ene-Th egarid's essay, "From Technique to *Musique*: The Institutional Pedagogy of Nadia Boulanger," deftly utilizes archival materials to elucidate how the institutions in which Boulanger learned prior to World War I--Paris's Conservatoire nationale de musique et de declamation--and taught after World War I--the  cole Normale de Musique, the Conservatoire am ricaine de

Fontainebleau, and in her apartment on Rue Ballu—shaped Boulanger’s pedagogical approaches throughout her long teaching career. Cédric Segond-Genovesi’s introduction to “The Beethoven Lectures for the Longy School” as well as Kimberly Francis’s essay “Boulanger and Atonality: A Reconsideration,” reveal Boulanger’s engagement with a bevy of analytical and compositional approaches. Through analysis of Boulanger’s score annotations and her lectures championing post-tonal composers, Francis importantly corrects the mythology that Boulanger was uninterested in post-tonal musical approaches, demonstrating “the fluidity of Boulanger’s analytical knowledge as well as her interest in works that employed serialist techniques, particularly their contrapuntal and motivic potential” (p. 278).

As a scholar who considers musicians’ material circumstances, the objects—musical and otherwise—that populate musicians’ lives, and musicians’ relationships to these objects and their environments, I was especially taken with Cédric Segond-Genovesi’s chapter, “36 rue Ballu: A Multifaceted Place.” In this piece, Segond-Genovesi considers the material environment of Nadia Boulanger’s home and teaching arena: her Paris apartment, which she shared with her sister and mother until their deaths in 1918 and 1935, respectively. Segond-Genovesi turns to photographs of Boulanger’s apartment and accounts from her many students who took private lessons with Boulanger or attended her Wednesday afternoon classes in order to provide a map of Boulanger’s living and working spaces with attention to how she and others moved through and created meaning within these spaces. His analysis reveals how Boulanger articulated her relationships to Parisian high society, important patrons, and beloved family members and friends through the objects she displayed at Rue Ballu, albeit in ways that would have been experienced differently depending on where one was sitting in her apartment, allowing Boulanger to maintain private relationships with some objects and more public relationships with others.

Amongst the most exciting aspects of *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* is the way the volume addresses Boulanger in global and transnational contexts. Musicologists such as Brigid Cohen and Tamara Levitz—amongst numerous others—have articulated the importance of moving beyond the national frameworks of music study that were part and parcel of the field’s development in the late nineteenth century, and that have continued to shape musicological work into our current century.[3] This volume powerfully participates in this trend to view musicians—especially those who lived, worked, and made music in various global locations—through a transnational lens. Brooks’s engagement with transnational and transcultural perspectives is reflected in the range of essays, scholars, and primary sources chosen to participate in this project. For example, in addition to including essays by French and North American scholars who work on twentieth-century French musical cultures, this volume contains not only pieces from scholars such as Mackenzie Pierce and Andrea Bohlman, both of whom work on twentieth-century Polish musical cultures, but also primary sources translated from their original Polish. Bohlman’s and Pierce’s essay, “Friend and Force: Nadia Boulanger’s Presence in Polish Musical Culture”, demonstrates Boulanger’s vast influence on Polish music and musicians in the twentieth century, as well as the importance of looking beyond France’s borders to understand Boulanger’s life, community, and impact. Moreover, Brooks meaningfully engages with transnational considerations in her compelling contribution, “Modern French Music: Translating Fauré in America, 1925-1945,” which details Boulanger’s varied efforts to bring Gabriel Fauré’s musical works—and especially his requiem—into the fold of “French modernism” as understood by US American audiences in the first half of the twentieth century. In his introduction to Boulanger’s Beethoven lectures for the Longy School, Cédric Segond-Genovesi nicely communicates the importance of a multi-faceted, transcultural approach to studying Boulanger: “to assess Nadia

Boulanger's musical world, we must go beyond countries, institutions, and activities and explore her mental and technical tools" (p. 269).

Like all insightful books, *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* raises as many questions as it answers, highlighting various avenues for future research. For instance, I wondered why Boulanger's relationships with Poland and Polish musicians were emphasized when Boulanger had connections with so many people from so many different musical cultures. What other transcultural musical encounters might be explored when approaching Boulanger's life, career, and influence? Although bringing gender studies and feminist criticism to bear on Boulanger has been fairly common in recent years, Murchison's analysis in this volume of Boulanger's letters in relation to racial considerations is quite novel within Boulanger studies. What more could scholars learn through bringing critical race studies into discussions of Boulanger, other members of her musical circles, and their compositional, performance, teaching, and listening practices? Leon Botstein's contribution to the volume, "Why Music? Aesthetics, Religion, and the Ruptures of Modernity in the Life and Work of Nadia Boulanger," illuminates numerous connections between Boulanger and her contemporaries active in philosophical and religious discourse. What other connections might scholars examine in order to better understand Boulanger within her socio-cultural milieu? The many archival sources published in this volume helpfully begin to answer this question by offering fruitful starting points for future examinations of Boulanger's relationships and widespread social networks. *Nadia Boulanger and Her World* thus serves as a lovely tribute to Boulanger on the fiftieth anniversary of her death, illuminating many facets of Boulanger's life, career, and social environment, while also stressing how very much we have yet to learn about a woman who was one of the most important and influential musicians of the twentieth century.

LIST OF ESSAYS

Jeanice Brooks, "Preface: The Only Woman in the Picture"

Alexandra Laederich, "The Strange Fate of Boulanger and Pugno's *La ville morte*," translated by Charlotte Mandell

Jeanice Brooks and Kimberly Francis, "Serious Ambitions: Nadia Boulanger and the Composition of *La ville morte*"

"From the Trenches: Extracts from the Final Issue of the Paris Conservatory Gazette," edited by Nadia and Lili Boulanger; selected, introduced, and annotated by Annegret Fauser; translated by Anna Lehmann

Marie Duchêne-Thégarid, "From Technique to *Musique*: The Institutional Pedagogy of Nadia Boulanger," translated by Miranda Stewart

"Nadia Boulanger's 1935 *Carte du Tendre*," introduced by Marie Duchêne-Thégarid; introduction translated by Anna Lehmann

Cédric Segond-Genovesi, "36 rue Ballu: A Multifaceted Place," translated by Anna Lehmann

Nadia Boulanger, “‘What an Arrival!’: Nadia Boulanger's New World (1925),” translated and annotated by Jeanice Brooks; afterword by Gayle Murchison

Jeanice Brooks, “Modern French Music: Translating Fauré in America, 1925-1945”

May Sarton, “For Nadia Boulanger: Five Poems by May Sarton,” introduced by Jeanice Brooks

Andrea F. Bohlman and J. Mackenzie Pierce, “Friend and Force: Nadia Boulanger's Presence in Polish Musical Culture”

Zygmunt Mycielski, “‘What Awaits Them Now?’: A Letter to Paris,” translated and annotated by J. Mackenzie Pierce

“A Letter from Professor Nadia Boulanger,” translated by J. Mackenzie Pierce

“The Beethoven Lectures for the Longy School,” introduced by Cédric Segond-Genovesi; translated by Miranda Stewart

Kimberly Francis, “Boulanger and Atonality: A Reconsideration”

Leon Botstein, “Why Music? Aesthetics, Religion, and the Ruptures of Modernity in the Life and Work of Nadia Boulanger”

NOTES

[1] Jeanice Brooks, *The Musical Work of Nadia Boulanger: Performing Past and Future Between the Wars* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2013); Kimberly A. Francis, *Teaching Stravinsky: Nadia Boulanger and the Consecration of a Modernist Icon* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015); Jillian C. Rogers, *Resonant Recoveries: French Music and Trauma Between the World Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2021).

[2] Kimberly A. Francis, *Nadia Boulanger and the Stravinskys: A Selected Correspondence* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2018); Jeanice Brooks and Kimberly A. Francis, eds., *Nadia Boulanger: Thoughts on Music* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2020).

[3] Brigid Cohen, “Limits of National History: Yoko Ono, Stefan Wolpe, and Dilemmas of Cosmopolitanism,” *The Musical Quarterly* 97, no. 2 (2014): 181-237; Cohen, “Diasporic Dialogues in Mid-Century New York: Stefan Wolpe, George Russell, Hannah Arendt, and the Historiography of Displacement,” *Journal of the Society for American Music* 6, no. 2 (May 2012): 143-173; Cohen, *Stefan Wolpe and the Avant-Garde Diaspora* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012); “Colloquy: Musicology Beyond Borders?,” Tamara Levitz, convenor, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 65, no. 3 (2012): 821-861. See also Arnulf Mattes, “The Eclipse Effects of Stardom: Edvard Grieg as a Challenge to National Musicology,” *History of Humanities* 5, no. 1 (2020): 131-150; Alejandro Madrid, *Transnational Encounters: Music and Performance at the US-Mexico Border* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).

Jillian C. Rogers
Indiana University-Bloomington
rogersjc@indiana.edu

Copyright © 2021 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of *H-France Review* nor republication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on *H-France Review* are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172