

---

H-France Review Vol. 20 (December 2020), No. 215

Quitterie Cazes, *Sculptures romanes toulousaines: Regards croisés*. Toulouse: Presses universitaires du Midi, 2019. 189 pp. Illustrations by Anne Péchou. English translation by Robert Glass. Plans, drawings, glossary, and bibliography. €25.00 (pb). ISBN 987-2-8107-0628-0.

Review by Tessa Garton, College of Charleston.

Toulouse contains an exceptional collection of Romanesque sculpture, reflecting the rich medieval culture of the city and the value it attached to the art of sculpture. Much of this sculpture is still *in situ* in the church of Saint-Sernin, well known as one of the major monuments of Romanesque architecture, and appearing in most general textbooks of art history as a characteristic example of the Romanesque architecture of the pilgrimage roads to Santiago de Compostela. Other important Romanesque buildings in Toulouse were destroyed in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, but capitals and reliefs from the cloisters and chapter houses of the cathedral of Saint-Etienne and the monastery of Sainte-Marie de la Daurade have been preserved in the Musée des Augustins in Toulouse. The book *Sculptures romanes toulousaines: Regards croisés*, by a major scholar of the Romanesque in Toulouse, Quitterie Cazes, thus promises to be a valuable resource to enthusiasts of Romanesque art.

*Sculptures romanes toulousaines: Regards croisés* consists of a text in French accompanied by watercolour illustrations, as well as a full English translation. The reader is immediately struck by the surprising choice of watercolour sketches rather than photographs to illustrate an art history text. It is presumably with reference to this unusual combination of scholarly text and artistic interpretation that the book is subtitled *Regards croisés*, and the genesis of the book is briefly explained in the foreword. The author recounts her encounters with the artist, Anne Péchou, sketching at the Musée des Augustins and the church of Saint-Sernin, “trying to recreate, through the stroke of her pencil, the energetic creative impulse of the sculptor who created the work in the twelfth century.” The decision to produce a collaborative work arose from “long discussions about the meaning of these sculptures, both for those who lived in the twelfth century and for us today” (English translation, p. 148).

Cazes has researched and published extensively on the Romanesque sculpture and architecture of Toulouse and the text reflects her deep and thorough familiarity with the buildings and their history. While referring to previous scholarship and differing interpretations of the monuments, the text is not overburdened with scholarly argument and is easy to follow for the general reader. The book appears to be aimed at a general rather than a scholarly audience, but provides thorough and detailed discussion of the monuments and individual sculptures.

The introduction presents the unique character of medieval Toulouse, its “courtly” civilization and the importance of sculpture—particularly religious sculpture—promoted by the Church. The sequence of monuments provides a progression from sculptures preserved in an architectural context at Saint-Sernin to sculptures from destroyed cloisters and monastic buildings, now displayed in the museum. Each monument is introduced with a plan and reconstruction of the original building complex, and an account of the historical and cultural context. The sculptures are presented in chronological sequence within the discussion of each building, indicating developments in style and the succession of different workshops. Each is presented with contextual information and an explanation of the iconography, with biblical and patristic sources, and with reference to texts likely to have been familiar to medieval monastic viewers. The liturgical context of the imagery is also addressed where relevant.

The reader is thus given a thorough range of textual information with which to appreciate and interpret the sculptures, and naturally looks for visual imagery to support the text. Typically, this would be provided by photographs, but the only photographs are a few general views of the nave, the Porte Miègeville and the west portal of Saint-Sernin, and the façade and interior of Saint-Etienne. The watercolours which appear alongside the text for each sculpture illustrate their general form and iconography, with the added rendering of colour, but they do not provide a student of art history with visual evidence to support the text, particularly when it comes to the discussion of style. Nor does the text make any reference to the character or qualities of the illustrations, so that it is not clear how they are to be understood in relation to the art historical interpretation provided by the text.

The first monument to be discussed is the church of Saint-Sernin, where the sculptures remain in their architectural and liturgical context. After a short survey of the history and origins of the site, from the story of the martyrdom of Saturnin in the third century to the construction of the present church in the eleventh and twelfth centuries, Cazes presents a series of sculptures from “the beginnings of Romanesque sculpture in Toulouse during the years 1070-1080,” in the transept and chevet of the church and on the Porte des Comtes (pp. 18-27). The next group of sculptures, “Saint-Sernin shortly before 1100: the altar and its environment” (pp. 28-37), is associated with the work of Bernard Gilduin, who signed the marble altar-table consecrated by Pope Urban II in 1096, and whose style and influence is recognizable in the famous marble panels now located around the ambulatory. Péchou’s illustration (p. 33) groups the three panels as they would have been seen in their original context as a retable, providing indications of colour which would have no doubt enlivened the images. However, it does not render finer details, which would surely also have been picked out in colour, such as the jeweled frame around the Christ in Majesty or the carved inscriptions on the scrolls of the seraphim and cherubim: *et clamant sanctus, sanctus, sanctus* (p. 32). And while the text discusses differences between the style of Bernard Gilduin and his contemporaries, and their indebtedness to Roman models, these aspects cannot be satisfactorily understood from the accompanying illustrations.

A photograph of the Porte Miègeville provides the reader with an image of the sculpture in context, and Cazes’s text emphasizes the monumentality of this portal and the impact of its carvings on contemporary sculptors in the transept portal of Santiago de Compostela, thus dating the sculptures to around 1105 (p. 39). In discussing the capitals, “sculpted on all four sides, even though the sculptors well knew that only two of them would be visible” (English translation, p. 158), Cazes curiously does not mention the possibility that these capitals may have originally been intended for another location. The discussion of the west portal of Saint-Sernin provides an

attempted reconstruction of the iconographic program based on the fragmentary surviving sculptures and descriptions from the sixteenth and seventeenth century (p. 55). The section on Saint-Sernin terminates with a discussion of the cloister demolished in the early nineteenth century, which contained about a hundred Romanesque capitals, of which perhaps twenty-three are preserved in the Musée des Augustins, but only one with a definitely recorded provenance (p. 62). The attribution of other capitals on the basis of style, including two capitals found in 2015, would benefit from the inclusion of photographs. One is evidently unfinished, and both are attributed by Cazes to the sculptor of the Porte Miègeville, thus dating the work shortly after 1100 (pp. 66-67).

A coloured drawing provides a reconstruction of the episcopal complex of Saint-Etienne, with the largest cloister in the south of France, modeled on that at Moissac and originally containing ninety-six capitals (pp. 72-73). Only a few capitals are preserved in the Musée des Augustins, but these are works of extraordinary quality, attributed to the sculptor Gilabertus. The first to be discussed is a capital carved on three faces with a continuous narrative of the death of John the Baptist, in a dramatic sequence that Cazes explains vividly, emphasizing the innovations in dramatic narrative. Péchou illustrates this with a continuous frieze (p. 69) and a series of separate illustrations of individual scenes (pp. 74-77). The coloured illustrations may help bring the narrative alive, but the original sculpture is itself so seductive and emotionally charged that this reader (and probably others familiar with the work) would prefer to see the original sculpture in all its fine detail and three-dimensional complexity.

Eight panels with reliefs of apostles survive from the chapter house of Saint-Etienne, demolished in 1811, and their dating and original arrangement has been much debated.<sup>[1]</sup> Cazes presents the proposal that “the four apostles who were sculpted individually could have been placed two by two in the jambs of the portal, while the double reliefs [sic] were placed in at the bottom of the vertical part of the arches of each of the lateral bays” (English translation p. 172). The sculptor Gilabertus was named in two inscriptions on the base of the reliefs of Andrew and Thomas, recorded in the nineteenth century but since disappeared. Cazes discusses the innovative treatment of these figures, their position on the diagonal of the block, and the refinement and elegance of their appearance and clothing. She compares the style of two assistants responsible for the other reliefs of the apostles, whose work she dates to c.1110 on the basis of stylistic links with the sculpture of the Porte Miègeville at Saint-Sernin. This stylistic analysis again calls for visual evidence in the most accurate available form rather than an artistic interpretation. Cazes links the new style of Gilabertus to the courtly “urbane” society of the early twelfth century spread by the troubadours and William of Aquitaine, a theme discussed more fully in her earlier essay (see note 1).

A significant number of sculptures from the cloister and chapter house of La Daurade are preserved in the Musée des Augustins. Roughly half of the original fifty or so cloister capitals have survived, and are grouped into four major “workshops” active at different periods during the twelfth century. The monastery was given to the Cluniac abbey of Moissac in 1077, and the first workshop appears to have consisted of two sculptors who came from Moissac soon after 1100, repeating some iconographic themes from Moissac and introducing innovative iconography in two capitals depicting the Weighing of Souls and Last Judgment. The second workshop, which Cazes dates around 1120-30, produced an exceptional cycle of twelve capitals representing the Passion of Christ, introducing an architectural framework and often using the angle of the capital as the focus of action. Cazes’s vivid descriptions and analysis underline the

dramatic narrative effects, as in the scene of Christ washing Peter's feet, and the illustration of this scene emphasizes the innovative composition with the action taking place in front of a column at the angle of the capital (p. 106). However, as with the sculpture of Gilabertus, the expressive quality and fine detail of the original carvings and the creative use of three-dimensional space are not rendered by the watercolours.

The third workshop, probably active between the 1150s and 1180s, was responsible for a series of reliefs and column-statues on the façade of the chapter house, destroyed in 1811. Surviving descriptions leave the question of the original design uncertain; Cazes provides two possible schemes for its restoration, based on the proposals of K. Horste and S. Moralejo,<sup>[2]</sup> and discusses the evidence for the placement of the individual figures and their overall iconographic significance. The fourth workshop is more varied and eclectic, including capitals with figures framed by coils of vine tendrils, and small corner capitals with scenes such as boar-hunting, a sculptor at work, and monks being tonsured, set against a background of exuberant foliage. Some of these appear to have influenced sculptors at Gerona and Sant Cugat del Valles.

The final section presents the latest examples of Romanesque traditions in Toulouse, sculptures probably dateable to around 1200. Cazes presents the hypothesis that the Annunciation "of the Cordeliers" was made for the façade of Saint-Etienne, which was begun before 1210. The keystone of the eastern bay of the nave of Saint-Etienne also reflects earlier Romanesque forms while forming part of the new Gothic nave of the cathedral.

The conclusion summarizes the evolution and impact of Romanesque sculpture in Toulouse over a century and a half. Cazes emphasizes the importance of the revival of antiquity at Saint-Sernin and of the sculptures of Bernard Gilduin and others in influencing other centres both in the region and as far away as Compostela. The recruitment of Gilabertus at Saint-Etienne introduced a more elegant, courtly and contemporary style, also evident in the "second workshop" of La Daurade and influential in Languedoc and Catalonia. Antique influences were once more evident at the end of the twelfth century in statue-columns such as those of La Daurade. Cazes stresses the purpose of the sculptures as a means of communicating ideas to specific audiences, with distinct messages and content in public, clerical, and monastic spaces.

The book includes a full English translation, a glossary, and a short bibliography. The English translation is generally good, but occasionally confused and misleading, particularly in the translation of art historical terms. It would have been useful to have had an English-speaking art historian check the translation for accuracy and consistency.

It is unclear what is the intended audience for this book, and the disjunction between text and illustrations is highly problematic. Students of art history look for information on the original works, and for images which convey as precisely and accurately as possible the artistic qualities, form, and character of the Romanesque sculptures. Anne Péchou's watercolours and drawings present her individual interpretation and way of seeing and do not provide academic information. No indication is provided in the text as to how the viewer might appreciate and interpret Péchou's paintings, or what they contribute to an understanding of the original works. The "marriage" of such diverse approaches to the material does not work, and the paintings would perhaps have benefited from a separate publication, with an introduction discussing their significance and how the artist was inspired by the Romanesque originals. The text is an excellent guide for an interested visitor wishing to learn more about the extraordinary heritage of Romanesque

sculpture in Toulouse; it would ideally be read in the presence of the actual works, on site at Saint-Sernin, and in the museum in Toulouse.

#### NOTES

[1] Charlotte Riou, "Gilabertus me fecit... Parcours historiographique des sculptures du cloître de la cathédrale Saint-Étienne de Toulouse attribuées à Gilabertus," *Quaderns del Museu Episcopal de Vic* 3 (2009): 9-27; Quitterie Cazes, "Vers une datation 'haute' de l'oeuvre du sculpteur Gilabertus à Toulouse," in Rosa Alcoy, Dominique Allios, Maria Alessandra Bilotta, Manuela Gianandrea, eds., *Le plaisir de l'art du Moyen Âge. Commande, production et réception de l'œuvre d'art. Mélanges en hommage à Xavier Barral i Altet* (Paris: Picard, 2012), pp. 508-513.

[2] Kathryn Horste, *Cloister Design and Monastic Reform in Toulouse. The Romanesque Sculpture of La Daurade* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992). Serafin Moralejo, "La fachada de la sala capitular de la Daurade de Toulouse. Datos iconográficos para su reconstrucción," *Anuario de estudios medievales*, XIII (1983): 180-197.

Tessa Garton  
College of Charleston  
[gartont@cofc.edu](mailto:gartont@cofc.edu)

Copyright © 2020 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of *H-France Review* nor republication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on *H-France Review* are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172