H-France Review Vol. 19 (June 2019), No. 116

Olivier Millet and Luigi-Alberto Sanchi, eds., *Paris, carrefour culturel autour de 1500*. Paris: Presses de l'université Paris-Sorbonne (PUPS), 2016. 324 pp. Illustrations, maps, figures, notes, tables, and index. 25€ (pb). ISBN 979-10-231-0523-0.

Review by Robert J. Hudson, Brigham Young University.

At the MLA in Austin, Texas in 2016, the executive committees of medieval and sixteenthcentury French co-sponsored a roundtable with the provocative title "The Year 1500: Are We Modern Yet?" As the sole early modernist on that panel, I sincerely wish *Paris, carrefour culturel autour de 1500* had been in print prior to that debate. The volume truly is a rich collection of essays offering evidence of the sophisticated, international humanist networks that existed in the city of Paris around the year 1500, when it was coming into its own as a cosmopolitan and intellectual crossroads in early modern Europe. In the wake of the Valois victory in the Hundred Years War and the ensuing War of Burgundian Succession, with the Italian campaign recently declared and the Kingdom of France beginning to see itself as a developing nation, a royal state, Paris was a city ripe for the cultivation and circulation of ideas. This volume speaks directly to the fulfillment of such ideals.

Prior to examining more straightforwardly the individual sections and essays (listed at the end of this review), it would be useful to first identify a few of the overarching themes and key names that recur throughout the volume. One figure that seems to appear with an alarming frequency is that of humanist printer Josse Bade (Jodicus Badius or Ascensius), who is mentioned in nearly half of the essays of the volume. While Bade is recognized as one of the most erudite and experienced printers working in the Latin Quarter at the turn of the sixteenth century, it was surprising to see his name evoked as often as those of Erasmus of Rotterdam, Thomas More, Robert Gaguin, Jacques Lefèvre d'Étaples, Guillaume Budé, and others who are traditionally viewed as the luminaries of this period. The initially jarring prevalence of Bade is eventually made clear, but only at the end of the volume, when Louise Katz reveals that, alongside the annual Saulnier colloquium, of which this collection constitutes the proceedings, was organized an exposition at the sponsoring institution (and volume publisher) the Sorbonne: "Josse Bade, imprimeur humaniste" (p. 285). (In fact, Katz's previous contribution, also on Bade and his press, pp. 67-77, makes no mention of the exhibit.) Considering this confusion, a brief introduction of the conference and the exposition at the beginning of the volume would have been most welcome.

Erasmus, as mentioned above, along with the publication and diffusion of his works in Paris, as well as the formation of intellectual circles of proponents of and detractors from what would

become his school of thought, constitutes a central figure across this volume. It was admittedly refreshing, however, to see Lefèvre and Budé, both of whom are generally ascribed a secondary status when compared to Erasmus and More (and, a generation later in the century, Martin Luther), receive the critical attention they deserve in the pre-Reformation period. Then again, the volume's focus is Paris, after all, and it does remain consistent and true to its title as it explores the cultural and intellectual crossroads that abound across this urban locus. All the same, it is not limited to Paris's walls; when these networks extend beyond to the French kingdom or Europe more broadly, the authors featured in the volume follow these roads and nodes across the intellectual world of the early Renaissance. At the same time, they examine humanism as broadly conceived, including the university circuits, the book trade, the circulation of music, holy texts, translations, etc., all as interconnected systems in this increasingly urbane and cultured world.

Moving on to the individual contributions themselves, the opening essay by eminent Renaissance scholar Frank Lestringant on Paris's cosmography at the dawn of the sixteenth century is well worth the (quite reasonable) price of the volume. In fact, I intend to regularly assign this essay to students in my upper division early modern culture and literature courses when introducing post-medieval/pre-Revolution Paris. Returning to this idea of interconnected systems extending beyond the city walls, Lestringant mentions François I's famous axiom to Charles V that Paris is a country and not just a city (p. 12). Appealing to the contemporary accounts of Gaguin, Lemaire, Corrozet, Belleforest, and Thevet, alongside the Münster map depicting Paris in 1530, the author adopts the role of a Parisian Virgil, as he shepherds his reader through the Renaissance city, orienting her by indicating the prominent features, divisions, and hubs that make up the landscape of the historical and legendary realm that will become the backdrop for the essays to follow.

The volume's first section on institutions and networks begins befittingly with Jacques Verger's examination of Paris's position within the European academic scene in 1500. Comparing the Sorbonne against the few dozen "new" universities in Christendom since the mid-1400s but, more importantly, set side by side with still active older establishments (Bologna, Oxford, Cambridge, Montpellier, Toulouse, Salamanca, Padua, Naples, and Lisbon), Verger takes into account the university's urban setting, academic physiognomy, and fundamental identity, placing Paris as the point of convergence of the traditions of antiquity, Christian revelation and the triumph of the French monarchy (p. 22). Within this university setting, the next essay by Jean-Marie Flamand takes up the reforms with which Verger concludes and applies them to the innovative pedagogical methods instituted by Jacques Lefèvre d'Étaples, in what he terms a period of fermentation for reformist thought (p. 48). The Latin Quarter and Rue Saint-Jacques is largely inescapable in the subsequent offering by Christine Bénévent, which traces the production, sales, and reception of Erasmus's Adages, a text appearing squarely in the year 1500. Next, the aforementioned Katz article does a remarkable job contextualizing and offering a networks-based biography of renowned printer Bade. Social systems and literary associations are likewise the focus of Cédric Vanhems's following piece, which traces the correspondence-as-literary work of Budé, eventually the founder of both the Bibliothèque royale and what would become the Collège de France, between Italy, England, and provincial France. This robust opening section comes to a close with Alice Tacaille's study of the creation and distribution of printed polyphonic music in 1528, reaching back and comparing this to written music circulated more closely to the period in question.

Despite its ostensible proposal to group sources and their circulation, what the second section of this volume does especially well is to introduce readers to vastly interesting but otherwise obscure personages linked to the production of source materials and the critical texts they produced from around 1500. In her offering on translations from the circles of Anne de Bretagne, Estelle Doudet builds on Cynthia Brown's research on the queen's extensive practice of book patronage to introduce a coterie of translators, at the same time reading between the lines of translated texts to locate the ideological underpinnings behind these translations. Introducing his subject as a forgotten figure of Parisian humanism, Olivier Pédeflous reacquaints the reader with Rémy Roussel, who was a key figure in transmitting Ouintilian and Poliziano to a French elite, as well as an early proponent of Greek, in early-sixteenth-century Paris. For his part, Romain Menini traces the reintroduction of Lucian to the learned French world, especially prior to the 1506 Latin translations of Erasmus and More, while taking a close look at the annotations in a 1496 Florentine edition of the Syrian rhetorician that made its way to Paris and is now housed in the Bibliothèque Nationale. Plautus and early French editions and imitations of his comedies are the matter of Mathieu Ferrand's text. And, to round out the section, Judith Kogel analyzes the creation and the Hebraic sources of Robert Estienne's 1548 Thesaurus Linguae Sanctae.

If the first section examined key figures in relation to the Sorbonne, the third portion (which effectively bookends the analytical body of this collection) deals with the reception of early Renaissance thinkers more widely considered. Gilbert Fournier's opening essay "Contra Erasmum" may very well offer answers to Bénévent's earlier questions as to why Erasmus's sojourn in Paris was so short-lived and why his commentaries on the city remained forever lukewarm, as he traces the development of Erasmus from an individual thinker to a figure of the collective memory of heretical thought. Sylvie Lefèvre follows Fournier with a look into the life of another fascinating figure at the crossroads Fausto Andrelini, a notable traveler, professor, and royal poet. Since paths that converge in Paris all originate somewhere, Jelle Koopmans's investigation into the arrival of Roman typeface and the printers from Normandy, Burgundy, and Champagne who brought it to the city is especially rich, establishing Paris not only as a meeting place for writers (p. 243) but also for literary conventions and texts. From the royal court to the seemingly immovable press, the year 1500 marks the beginning of an era of rapidly increasing mobility. Following Koopmans, the subject of Perrine Galand's contribution is one Belgian poet Remacle d'Ardenne, whose Neo-Latin verse, in the spirit of intellectual crossroads, was influenced by Andrelini and Erasmus, while also being published by Bade. With echoes of Catullus blending with the Quattrocento elegiac tradition in his Amours, Remacle is a model for the Lyonnais school (Pernette du Guillet) as well as the Pléiade (Pierre de Ronsard). Finally, also coming to Paris from Italy, the eponymous giant from Morgante il Gigante of courtly poetic fame is the subject of Francesco Montorsi's article, which traces the evolution of the poem from the 1483 Pulci original through its translation in Paris in 1519, while also hypothesizing on the bellicose and Gallican spirit the chivalrous work takes on through its transmission into vernacular French.

The volume's fourth section contains only Katz's reflection on the role of Bade's press in the diffusion of erudite texts in the period, as well as Isabelle Diry's handsomely illustrated annotated bibliography of the twenty-six Bade editions displayed at the aforementioned exposition.

Read individually, each of the essays in this volume is exceptionally well researched, while being sufficiently accessible to stand alone as an entry point into the study of the figures examined, whether canonical or obscure, and the role of each in 1500 Paris. However, those who endeavor to read the text linearly will be impressed by the common links and nodes, the networks and crossroads, shared between the essays and brought to life against the backdrop of Lestringant's opening cosmography. Essential reading for any scholar seeking to better understand Paris at the twilight of the medieval era and/or the dawn of the Renaissance, this collection of crossroads also provides an impressive array of avenues for exploring the question, "The year 1500: is Paris modern yet?"

LIST OF ESSAYS

Frank Lestringant, "Le Paris des cartographes (XVIe siècle)"

Première Partie: Les institutions et les réseaux

Jacques Verger, "La place de Paris dans le réseau des Universités européennes vers 1500"

Jean-Marie Flamand, "Lefèvre d'Étaples et le renouveau de l'enseignement universitaire parisien"

Christine Bénévent, "Réseaux érasmiens autour de l'édition Parisienne des Adages (1500)"

Louise Katz, "Le Praelum Ascensianum: carrefour parisien, carrefour européen"

Cédric Vanhems, "Le réseau européen des correspondants de Guillaume Budé"

Alice Tacaille, "Chanter sans partition à Paris vers 1500: les paroliers sans musique"

Deuxième partie: Les sources et leur circulation

Estelle Doudet, "Traduire pour la reine. La circulation des traductions autour d'Anne de Bretagne"

Olivier Pédeflous, "Rémy Roussel (Remigius Rufus Candidus Aquitanius), figure oubliée de l'humanisme parisien"

Romain Menini, "Lucien de Samosate à Paris: notes complémentaires sur un exemplaire annoté (BnF Rés. Z 247)"

Mathieu Ferrand, "Plaute à Paris: diffusion et imitation des comedies plautiniennes au début du XVIe siècle"

Judith Kogel, "Le *Thesaurus linguae sanctae* de Robert Estienne (1548): dialogue entre éditions latines et hébraïques"

Troisième partie: Les auteurs et leur réception

Gilbert Fournier, "'Contra Erasmum': nouveaux indices de la réception parisienne et universitaire d'Érasme"

Sylvie Lefèvre, "Fausto Andrelini ou l'homme carrefour. Italien naturalisé, professeur à Paris et poète royal de Charles VIII à François I^{er}"

Jelle Koopmans, "Les textes et les hommes à Paris autour de 1500: Bourgignons, Champenois, Normands et leurs presences dans la capitale"

Perrine Galand, "Les *Amours* (1513) d'un Belge à Paris: Remacle d'Ardenne, 'le plus ancient poète néo-latin d'amour en France"

Francesco Montorsi, "Paris, la croisade, le Concordat de Bologne. Une lecture contextualisante de *Morgant le Géant*"

Quatrième partie: Les livres de Josse Bade dans les collections de la Sorbonne

Louise Katz, "La production des presses Josse Bade"

Isabelle Diry, "Liste des ouvrages exposés"

Robert J. Hudson Brigham Young University bob_hudson@byu.edu

Copyright © 2019 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor republication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on *H-France Review* are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172