

H-France Review Vol. 1 (February 2001), No. 2

Robert Aldrich and Martyn Lyons, Eds., *The Sphinx in the Tuileries and Other Essays in Modern French History: Papers Presented at the Eleventh George Rudé Seminar.* University of Sydney, 1999. vi + 399, notes. ISBN 1-86487-026-5.

Review by Kenneth Margerison, Southwest Texas State University.

Originally presented in 1998 at the Eleventh George Rudé Seminar held in Sydney, Australia, this collection of thirty essays addresses a variety of topics in French history spanning the period from the eighteenth through the twentieth centuries. Areas receiving the greatest attention include the French Revolution (six essays), the 1848 Revolution (five essays), French colonial history (five essays), issues of gender (six essays), and community history (three essays). As with all such published proceedings of conferences, the essays in this collection are somewhat uneven; however, the great majority exhibit good scholarship, and several make important contributions to the literature.

As befits a conference held as a memorial to George Rudé, the great historian of revolutionary crowds, a number of papers consider aspects of the French Revolution, and James Friguglietti provides an interesting account of the family background of George Rudé himself. Paul Hanson and David Garrioch defend the Rudé legacy by offering reappraisals of the recent trend condemning revolutionary violence and those responsible for it. Hanson's essay, "Revolutionary Violence, Political Legitimacy and the 'Journées' of 10 August and 31 May," specifically challenges the concept that the Girondins were defenders of the rule of law in contrast to the Montagnards' support of the violent actions of the revolutionary crowds. Hanson argues that the Girondins supported crowd violence on 10 August in Paris and later in Lyon because in these instances they benefited politically from such popular intervention. During the Convention, however, they spoke out against the crowd activity in Paris that was specifically directed against them. Hanson concludes that any verbal opposition to violence was simply a Girondin political maneuver to counter their political opposition in the Convention. Garrioch examines the level of Terror found in the Gobelins/Finistère section of Paris. Instead of the "bloodstained" record one might expect to find in one of the poorest and most radical areas of the city, Garrioch argues that this section had relatively little terroristic activity and that which did exist was clearly justified by the activities of the victims. Thus, according to Garrioch, not all revolutionaries were violent, and, at least in this section, the violence that did develop was warranted. Other essays on the revolution have a varied subject matter. Kristy Carpenter investigates with the career of Marie-Joseph Chénier, and Alison Patrick examines the careers of the members of the Constituent Assembly after 1791.

A variety of aspects of the 1848 Revolution appear in this collection. Jean-Yves Mollier provides an insightful analysis of the variegated nature of French culture and society in 1848 and the difficulties that such diversity presented for the republican experiment as manifested in the June Days and the election of Bonaparte as president. Mollier is particularly interested to demonstrate the intellectuals' continued support for the republic through 1851. Michael Adcock demonstrates how the various governments after 1848 utilized their patronage of art to bolster a particular view of labor. As the revolution became socially more conservative, the government sponsorship of paintings that reflected aspects of the laboring classes reflected that conservatism. Michael David Sibalís provides an interesting study of The

Fraternal Association of Worker Tailors, a cooperative of journeymen tailors organized initially to make uniforms for the National Guard. Often associated with socialism and increasingly criticized, the Association in fact tried to compete with more capitalistic enterprises in an effort to maintain their traditional craft. Peter McPhee's informative essay, "The Changing Contours of 1848," while evaluating recent analyses of events in that year, primarily examines gendered approaches to understanding the revolution. McPhee provides an excellent analysis of the current state of the historiographical debate on the role of women in the revolution and the attitudes of men toward female political involvement.

Two other essays, however, are less sympathetic to recent interpretations of gender roles in the French past. Hamish Graham, in "Women and Wood: the Gender Dimensions of Timber-Gathering and Wood-Theft in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries," undertakes a critique of the concept of the gendered forest posited by Peter Sahlins. Arguing that wood gathering was not an activity undertaken only by peasant women, Graham provides considerable evidence that this essential function of the peasant household was undertaken by all members of the family. Likewise in "Warriors and Killers: Women and Violence During the Paris Commune, 1871" Robert Tombs is eager to demonstrate, contrary to much recent scholarship, that women did not play a greater role in 1871 than in previous revolutionary upheavals. Tombs, for instance, challenges the frequently cited example of the bravery of a women's battalion which defended the *Place Blanche* by presenting evidence that no such battalion existed. While not denying that women played a role in 1871, he argues that they did so in the more traditional role of *cantinières*. In this capacity they might very well have engaged in some of the fighting, but, as the arrest records demonstrate, they were rarely charged with participating in overt military activity. Other essays analyzing gender include Olivia Harmon's study of the image of females in eighteenth-century utopian novels, Barrie Rose's account of the role of women in the Babeuf conspiracy, and Bronwyn Winter's examination of the campaign of contemporary French women for political parity.

In the area of colonial history, the conference papers address topics that range from the debates over the colonies in the Constituent Assembly (1789-91) to the problem of decolonization after World War II. Judy Anderson provides some interesting insights on the attitudes and activities of the Bordeaux merchant community, which had a large financial stake in the maintenance of the old colonial system and its reliance on slave labor. Her conclusions, however, will not radically alter historians' current understanding of the decisions of the assembly with regard to the colonies and slavery. Robert Aldrich provides a very insightful account of the establishment of the *Jardin Colonial* in Paris in 1899 and its relationship to the French concept of Empire. His description of the dilapidated remains of the facility provide a poignant commentary on the contemporary French interest in its colonial past. By far the most substantive article on colonialism is that of Martin Thomas on the French resistance against Japan in Indochina during World War II. Thomas convincingly demonstrates that many of the problems that France would experience after the war were a direct outgrowth of its preferred method of opposing the Japanese. Refusal to place any value on help from the populace and determination to reestablish its full colonial authority at the end of the war insured that the Viet Minh would ultimately win the hearts and minds of the populace. Essays by Pierre Daprin and David Prochaska on colonial discourses and literature also provide insights into French thinking about Empire.

The remaining essays of the collection, which primarily focus on the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, form an eclectic mixture ranging from Michele Cunningham's informative diplomatic study of the development of British and French policy towards Mexico during the reign of Napoleon III to Iain Cameron's analysis of the films of Bertrand Tavernier and Emily Chester's interesting study of Napoléon Peyrat's influence on the development and various uses of the romantic myth of the Albigensians.

Community studies include examinations of the character and decline of French mining communities in the twentieth century and the nature of the Jewish community of Strasbourg. Charles Sowerwine offers a provocative discussion of the industrial community Oyonnax. Within a theoretical framework

provided by the economist Alfred Marshall and the work of other historians of small communities, Sowerwine analyzes the unique features of this town characterized by small family firms engaged in a highly competitive, but also cooperative, enterprise making plastic products. The inhabitants, both manufacturers and workers, clearly interacted as a community with shared goals, and the various interests of the community were mediated through the authority of the municipality controlled by the Communist Party.

Two of the essays link events of the great revolution with more recent history. Almut Franke makes a very valuable comparison between the demands of former émigrés who demanded the return of their lands after the restoration of the Bourbons in 1815 and the similar demands in Germany for restitution of confiscated property after the fall of the Berlin Wall and the reunification of Germany in 1989. Using the French émigrés as a case study, Franke describes the returned French émigrés' continual frustration with the various pieces of nineteenth-century legislation designed to provide compensation rather than the actual restoration of their property. She compares the French experience with the similar problems that have accompanied German efforts to provide compensation to those whose land had been expropriated after 1945. John Horne provides a highly stimulating essay "From *levée en masse* to 'Total War': France the Revolutionary Legacy, 1870-1945." The revolutionary concept of the *levée en masse*, according to Horne, was resurrected after the military defeats of the Second Empire and served as the underlying principal of French military organization during the Third Republic. Just as the French relied on the continuation of the myth of the revolutionary *levée en masse*, their German opponents from the Franco-Prussian War through the two world wars feared a mobilized citizenry and undertook to punish severely any perceived civilian opposition to German military authority. Ultimately, even the Resistance relied on the myth of the *levée en masse* to conduct its opposition to German occupation of France.

Finally, Laurence Brown and Vesna Drapac consider the events and attitudes of the 1930s and 1940s in France. Brown demonstrates that academics outside of Paris were just as politically engaged as their Parisian counterparts during the 1930s. Drapac persuasively argues that collaborationism during World War II is not so easily identified as some historians believe. Active resistance to the Nazi regime, she points out, was often a function of time and place, and much resistance was of a subtle nature, such as women discouraging fascist ideology in the home.

The essays presented at the Eleventh George Rudé Seminar deal with a number of important topics, and historians will find considerable food for thought in the essays dealing with their specialities. Those tempted to read outside the area of their own interest will be rewarded with a number of insightful essays on topics with which they are only generally familiar.

LIST OF ESSAYS

Olivia Harman, "Individual and Collective Bliss: An Exploration of Gender in French Utopias of the Pre-Revolutionary Period."

Hamish Graham, "Women and Wood: The Gender Dimensions of Timber-Gathering and Wood-Theft in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries."

Kristy Carpenter, "Marie-Joseph Chénier: Poet, Deputy and Intellectual."

Alison Patrick, "Towards a New Elite?."

James Friguglietti, "How George Frederick Elliot Rude Became the Historian George Rudé."

Paul R. Hanson, "Revolutionary Violence, Political Legitimacy and the 'Journées' of 10 August and 31 May."

David Garrioch, "Revolutionary Violence and Terror in the Paris Sections."

Barrie Rose, "Babeuf, Women, and the Conspiracy of the Equals."

Jean-Yves Mollier, "Les Intellectuels et la culture en 1848 dans l'espace français."

Peter McPhee, "The Changing Contours of 1848."

Rudolph Binion, "Centenary and Sesquicentenary: A Semicentennial Leap."

Michael Adcock, "The Republic of Labour? Representations of Working People in French Art during the Second Republic."

Michael David Sibalis, "The Parisian Tailors in 1848: The Association fraternelle des ouvriers tailleurs (The 'Atelier de Clichy')."

Robert Tombs, "Warriors and Killers: Women and Violence during the Paris Commune, 1871."

Judy Anderson, "Principles of Universal Liberty and the Mechanics of Exclusion: The Contribution of the Merchants of Bordeaux to the Colonial Debate of 1790."

Robert Aldrich, "Vestiges of the Colonial Empire: The Jardin Colonial in Paris."

Martin Thomas, "Imperialist Guerillas? The French Resistance in Indochina, 1943-1945."

Pierre Dapryni, "From Indochina to North Africa: French Discourses on Decolonisation."

David Prochaska, "Writing Colonial Algeria."

Michele Cunningham, "Perfidious Albion and the Sphinx of the Tuileries: Anglo-French Relations During the Second Empire."

Almut Franke, "Restitution or Indemnity: The Problem of Confiscated Properties in France and Germany after a Revolution."

Charles Sowerwine, "The Nature of Community: Cooperation, Communism and Competition in Oyonnax, 1919-1939."

Diana Cooper-Richet, "Le Monde de la mine en France XIXe-XXe siècles: analyse de la formation, du développement et du déclin d'un groupe professionnel type."

Emily Chester, "The Castle in the Air: Mystery, Myth and Memory at Montségur."

John Horne, "From levée en masse to 'Total War': France and the Revolutionary Legacy, 1870-1945."

Laurence Brown, "Between Dreyfus and Pétain: Academics, Students and Politics in 1930s France."

Vesna Drapac, "The Good, the Bad and the Uninteresting: A Comparative Approach Towards Defining Collaboration and Resistance in Occupied France."

Julie Kalman, "The Jewish Community of Strasbourg and the Crisis of the Mitterrand Era."

Iain A. Cameron, "Crime and Justice in the Films and Diary of Bertrand Tavernier."

Bronwyn Winter, "Liberté, égalité, parité: Women as Political Actors in France, Two Hundred Years Down the Track."

Kenneth Margerison,
Southwest Texas State University,
km04@swt.edu

Copyright © 2001 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172