

H-France Review Vol. 17 (June 2017), No. 85

Anne Motta, *Noblesse et pouvoir princier dans la Lorraine ducale, 1624-1737*. Paris: Classiques Garnier, 2016. 618 pp. Preface, notes, bibliography, map, chronology, genealogies, and index. 84.00€ (pb). ISBN 978-2-8124-5093-8.

Review by Brian Sandberg, Northern Illinois University.

Noblesse et pouvoir princier dans la Lorraine ducale, 1624-1737 provides a useful exploration of nobles and princely rule in a small ducal state in early modern Europe. The book opens with a description of the funeral of Charles III, duc de Lorraine (1545-1608). According to Anne Motta, “La cérémonie ‘à la royale’ rassemble tout en hiérarchisant mais, plus qu’une image de la société, elle est une représentation de l’État lorrain et de la fonction ducale, à laquelle la noblesse est associée” (p. 18). The elaborate funeral ceremonies were commemorated with a monumental series of prints by Claude de La Ruelle, which Motta uses to set the stage for her analysis of the relationships between the ducs de Lorraine and the Lorraine nobles during the turbulent seventeenth century. Motta exploits numerous volumes of manuscript correspondence, journals, *mémoires*, genealogies, noble titles, and legal documents in archival collections held in Paris, Nancy, Bar-le-Duc, Luxembourg, and other cities. The book is organized chronologically and divided into three sections on the relationship between the duc de Lorraine and the principal noble families of the duchy (1600-1630), the experience of war and military occupation (1630-1697), and the return to stability (1697-1737).

The first section reconstructs the contours of the power elite of the duché de Lorraine using manuscript genealogies and the records of successive investigations of nobility. Many of these seventeenth-century sources were produced by *hérauts d’armes*, who aimed to reveal the “most illustrious houses” of the duchy (p. 50). Antoine Furetière later remarked in his *Dictionnaire universel contenant généralement tous les mots français* (1690) that “les généalogistes ont fait plus de nobles que les rois,” leading Motta to probe the constructions of noble family myths in Lorraine (p. 52). This section also utilizes eighteenth-century erudite studies such as Dom Charles Ambroise Pelletier’s *Nobiliaire de la Lorraine et du Barrois* (1758) and Augustin Calmet’s *Histoire de Lorraine* (1757), which had very different agendas. Motta estimates that the nobility of Lorraine in the early seventeenth century consisted of seventy old noble lineages and five to six hundred recently ennobled families (pp. 57, 83-84).

The book probes the relationships between the ducal state of Lorraine and its nobles, as well as the disputes between old and new nobilities over their positions within the state. Old noble families were well integrated into ducal offices and also held benefices for their noblewomen in convents, such as the Saint-Pierre de Remiremont Abbey. The book sometimes digresses into institutional histories of particular organs of the ducal state, as when a section explores the origins of the judicial courts in the duché de Lorraine (pp. 106-118). The description of the États-Généraux de Lorraine assumes that the estate’s meetings provided “rare” occasions for political debate, but could have explored other avenues of political discussion and exchange (p. 127). The roles played by nobles within the ducal state are often abstracted: “au début du XVIIe siècle...les chevaliers représentent une véritable force politique” (p. 118).

The section provides little contextualization of the duchy's relations with the Holy Roman Empire or the Lorraine-Guise involvement in the French Wars of Religion (1562-1629).

The first section of the book concludes with an examination of the ascension of Charles IV to the ducal throne in 1624 and the controversy surrounding the succession. Motta analyzes the exclusion of Nicole, duchesse de Lorraine, and Charles IV's consolidation of power in the duché de Lorraine. Motta focuses especially on Charles IV's civic entry to Nancy in May 1626 and his ceremonial possession of his ducal capital through his oath and ritual of investiture (pp. 140-144). The book adopts a modernization narrative of state development to explain the reorganization of the duc de Lorraine's *maison militaire* and the growth of the ducal military forces in the early seventeenth century. Motta depicts the Lorraine nobility as a military elite that performed a "fonction militaire" in this modernizing state and simultaneously acted as a "noblesse traditionnelle" (pp. 162-163).

The second section deals with the turbulent period of the Thirty Years' War and the French military occupations of Lorraine from 1634 to 1697. A French army defeated Lorraine forces in 1633, allowing Louis XIII to enter Nancy and establish French rule over the duchy. Motta analyzes the coercive oath to the French king that royal councilors demanded Lorraine officials take in order to establish French domination of the duchy. Some Lorraine nobles took the oath quickly as *acceptants*, but others dragged their feet or refused altogether. A number of Lorraine nobles fled the duchy, joining Charles IV in exile. French forces often confiscated the properties of these *opposants*, but they became part of the military entourage of Charles IV, who had become a major military entrepreneur in Imperial service. French, Imperial, and Spanish armies crisscrossed the duchy during the 1630s-1650s, inflicting misery on the people of Lorraine. Even after the peace of Westphalia finally ended the Thirty Years' War in 1648, the Franco-Spanish War (1635-1659) raged on for another decade. Spanish forces arrested Charles IV in 1654, reopening the contested ducal succession and seriously dividing the Lorraine nobles, until his release with the Peace of the Pyrenees in 1659. Throughout this period, Lorraine nobles confronted war and political turmoil, attempting to preserve their lands, titles, and power.

The restoration of the duc de Lorraine in 1661 slowly transformed the ducal state. Then, Louis XIV's armies invaded the duchy in 1670, leading to a new military occupation lasting until 1697. The duc de Lorraine fled once again into exile and joined Imperial forces as a military commander. Motta finds that "Lors de ses conquêtes, Louis XIV privilégie plutôt le maintien des formes traditionnelles de l'administration" (p. 305), but many Lorraine nobles gradually took up French military service. When Charles IV finally died in 1675, a new succession struggle began, although the duchy remained occupied. Motta concludes this section with an extended analysis of Henri de Beauvau, marquis de Beauvau's *Mémoires* (1688), which harshly criticized the deceased Charles IV, accusing him of having betrayed his subjects.

The final section of the book examines the recomposition of the Lorraine nobility during the period from 1697 to 1737. The Peace of Ryswick ended the French occupation of Lorraine and allowed Léopold I to assume the ducal throne. The Lorraine nobles gradually adjusted to the restoration of the Lorraine dynasty and recovered their positions of authority within the ducal state. Léopold I reorganized his ducal administration, re-establishing judicial courts that had been suppressed during the military occupation, but adopting a French ministerial model (p. 395) and venal offices (pp. 489-493). The War of the Spanish Succession brought a new French military occupation, which Léopold I weathered at Lunéville—allowing Motta to focus on the ducal court and the "renaissance" of the Lorraine nobility in the early eighteenth century (p. 510). The revival of the Lorraine nobility was short-lived, however, since French troops once again occupied Lorraine in 1733. François III, duc de Lorraine, finally abandoned the duchy in 1737 as part of a transfer to the Grand Duchy of Tuscany, leaving Lorraine nobles to negotiate an accommodation with Louis XV or depart for imperial service.

The book presents the Lorraine nobility as caught between traditional social forms and modernity, but without ever developing an analytical framework for assessing the Lorraine state and society. There are some odd anachronisms, such as references to Victor Hugo's *L'Homme qui rit* (1869) to evoke the Lorraine nobles' sense of duty (p. 177). Motta utilizes the concept of *accommodants*, a term normally used to refer to French people living under Nazi occupation, to describe French military occupation of Lorraine (p. 187). The occupation of Lorraine is elsewhere described as a *cohabitation*, apparently alluding to periods of divided rule by a president and prime minister of opposing parties in modern French society (p. 245).

Anne Motta unfortunately fails to engage significantly with the broader historiographies on early modern nobilities and state development. The book relies heavily on a concept of *fidélités* inspired by Roland Mousnier, even if she acknowledges that attachments could be multiple and episodic (p. 314).^[1] Although the book does cite some international studies, it tends to ignore Anglophone authors—except for those working directly on the history of Lorraine. The book does not employ relevant Anglophone historiography on French nobles and royal government under Louis XIII.^[2] The position of the duché de Lorraine could be contextualized with works concerning the Thirty Years' War and seventeenth-century war and society.^[3] Comparisons with research on early modern nobilities and court culture would strengthen the book's analysis.^[4] Studies of Louis XIV, his royal state, and his wars could have provided a framework for understanding the precarious situation of Lorraine in the international relations of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries ^[5]. As a result, the book situates itself somewhat restrictively within a Francophone historiography of early modern states and nobilities.

Noblesse et pouvoir princier dans la Lorraine ducal offers a detailed examination of the ruling elite of the duché de Lorraine. Historians of early modern nobilities will be interested in this study of the ducs de Lorraine and their relationships with Lorraine nobles. The repeated military occupations of the duchy in the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries reveal the fragility of the ducal state and the difficult choices that Lorraine nobles faced in maintaining their social and political positions.

NOTES

[1] Yves Durand, ed., *Hommage à Roland Mousnier: clientèles et fidélités en Europe à l'époque moderne*. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1981); Roland Mousnier, *La vénalité des offices sous Henri IV et Louis XIII* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1971).

[2] Sharon Kettering, *Power and Reputation at the Court of Louis XIII: The Career of Charles d'Albert, duc de Luynes (1578-1621)* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013); Brian Sandberg, *Warrior Pursuits: Noble Culture and Civil Conflict in Early Modern France* (Baltimore, Md.: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2010); Kate Van Orden, *Music, Discipline, and Arms in Early Modern France* (Chicago, Il.: The University of Chicago Press, 2005); Keith P. Luria, *Sacred Boundaries Religious Coexistence and Conflict in Early-Modern France* (Washington D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 2005); Orest A. Ranum, *The Fronde: A French Revolution, 1648-1652* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1993); Donna Bohanan, *Old and New Nobility in Aix-En-Provence, 1600-1695: Portrait of an Urban Elite* (Baton Rouge, La.: Louisiana State University Press, 1992); Sharon Kettering, *Patrons, Brokers and Clients in Seventeenth-Century France* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986); Orest A. Ranum, *A Study of the Secretaries of State and Superintendents of Finance in the Ministry of Richelieu, 1635-1642* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963).

[3] David Parrott, *The Business of War: Military Enterprise and Military Revolution in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2012); Peter H. Wilson, *The Thirty Years War: Europe's Tragedy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2011); David Parrott, *Richelieu's Army: War, Government and Society in France, 1624-1642* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2006); Guy Rowlands, *The Dynastic State and the Army under Louis XIV: Royal Service*

and Private Interest, 1661-1701 (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2002); Lynn, John A. *Giant of the Grand Siècle: The French Army, 1610-1715* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

[4] Gregory Hanlon, *The Twilight of a Military Tradition: Italian Aristocrats and European Conflicts, 1560-1800* (London: Routledge, 2014); Matthew A. Vester, *Sabaudian Studies: Political Culture, Dynasty, and Territory (1400-1700)* (Kirksville, Mo.: Truman State University Press, 2013); Matthew A. Vester, *Renaissance Dynasticism and Apanage Politics: Jacques De Savoie-Nemours, 1531-1585* (Kirksville, Mo.: Truman State University Press, 2012); Hilla Zmora, *State and Nobility in Early Modern Germany: The Knightly Feud in Franconia, 1440-1567* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2002); John Adamson, ed., *The Princely Courts of Europe: Ritual, Politics and Culture Under the Ancien Régime, 1500-1750* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1999); Ronald G. Asch and Adolf M. Birke, eds., *Princes, Patronage, and the Nobility: The Court at the Beginning of the Modern Age, C. 1450-1650* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991); Geoffrey Symcox, *Victor Amadeus II: Absolutism in the Savoyard State, 1675-1730* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983).

[5] Darryl Dee, *Expansion and Crisis in Louis XIV's France: Franche-Comté and Absolute Monarchy, 1674-1715* (Rochester, N.Y.: University of Rochester Press, 2009); James B. Collins, *The State in Early Modern France*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2009); Julian Swann, *Provincial Power and Absolute Monarchy: The Estates General of Burgundy, 1661-1790* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Sara Chapman, *Private Ambition and Political Alliances in Louis XIV's Government: The Phélypeaux de Pontchartrain Family 1650-1750*. (Rochester, N.Y.: University of Rochester Press, 2004); John A. Lynn, *The Wars of Louis XIV, 1667-1714* (London: Longman 1997); William Beik, *Urban Protest in Seventeenth Century France* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1997); James B. Collins, *Classes, Estates and Order in Early-Modern Brittany* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1994); William Beik, *Absolutism and Society in Seventeenth-Century France State Power and Provincial Aristocracy in Languedoc* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

Brian Sandberg
Northern Illinois University
bsandberg@niu.edu

Copyright © 2017 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172