

H-France Review Vol. 16 (July 2016), No. 141

Marcel Proust, *In the Shadow of Young Girls in Flower* [*In Search of Lost Time*, vol. 2], trans. by C.K. Scott Moncrieff, edited and annotated by William C. Carter. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2015. xiv + 587 pp. \$24 U.S. (pb). ISBN: 978-0-300-18542-3

Adam Watt, University of Exeter.

Proust studies is a field with no shortage of heroic figures. One thinks readily of the extraordinary labours of Philip Kolb (editor of the twenty-one volume correspondence), the tireless detective work of Alison Finch in *Proust's Additions* (2 vols., 1977), of Anthony Pugh in *The Growth of A la recherche du temps perdu* (2 vols., 2004), the contributions of Jean-Yves Tadié as critic, biographer and Pléiade general editor, the scholarly publications of Luc Fraisse, or the ongoing work of the team directed by Nathalie Mauriac Dyer in Paris, preparing the invaluable diplomatic edition of the *Cahiers 1 à 75 de la Bibliothèque nationale de France* (2008-).[1] William C. Carter undoubtedly merits a place in such a roll call: his contribution to the field over the last three decades has been immense. In 1988 he was instrumental in bringing together the leading Proust scholars of the time, from both sides of the Atlantic (among them Roger Shattuck, J. Theodore Johnson Jr, Philip Kolb, Wallace Fowlie, Jean Milly and Nathalie Mauriac Dyer), resulting in the publication of the edited volume, *The UAB Marcel Proust Symposium: In Celebration of the 75th Anniversary of Swann's Way (1913-1988)*. [2] *The Proustian Quest* followed in 1992, a richly rewarding study of the multi-faceted roles of speed and fleetingness in Proust's thought and writing. [3] Carter also wrote and produced, with the support of awards from the National Endowment for the Humanities (1990-92), a documentary film: *Marcel Proust: The Making of a Writer* and, in 2008 published a further monograph, *Proust in Love*. [4] Carter's greatest contribution to date, however, is his towering biography of Proust, meticulously researched and accessibly written, first published in 2000 (to great critical and popular acclaim) and reissued for the centenary of *Swann's Way* in 2013 with a new preface by the author. While others might have rested on such considerable achievements, Carter shows no signs of stepping away from his desk: his new project is to revise, annotate and republish the entirety of the Scott Moncrieff translation of *A la recherche du temps perdu* in a new edition with Yale University Press, of which the work under review, *In the Shadow of Young Girls in Flower*, is the second volume.

The relative merits and pitfalls of the Scott Moncrieff translation, its revisions by Terence Kilmartin and D. J. Enright, and their position vis-à-vis the more recent collective endeavour published in the UK in 2002 under the general editorship of Christopher Prendergast (with volumes translated by Lydia Davis and James Grieve *entre autres*) have been widely discussed and debated. [5] For Carter, in the new Yale edition, it is a question "not so much of modernizing the text as of restoring Proust's sentences or phrases to their original simplicity." [6] Carter continues: "my sole intention in all the revisions that I have made was to bring Scott Moncrieff's excellent translation closer than ever before to the spirit and style of Proust's original text" (*Swann*, Carter, p. xvii). The other primary ambition of the project is to provide a properly annotated edition for an English-language readership. Carter's notes, nourished by his intimate knowledge of the novel, its author, and his time, are just as important an attribute of the project as the revisions themselves (examples of which I examine below).

The notes bring an extra dimension to the reading of Proust's novel that is largely absent from the Scott Moncrieff text and only partially achieved in Prendergast's edition. In Scott Moncrieff's *Within a Budding Grove*, endnotes are included, but only a token number—just fourteen for a novel that runs over six hundred pages in length. The Penguin version by James Grieve (whose revised title, *In the Shadow of Young Girls in Flower*, Carter also adopts) offers the reader a little more assistance—one hundred and twenty endnotes clarify points of cultural-historical interest, proper names and curiosities in the text. Proust's writing, as is well known, is a richly allusive weave and any given page offers the reader its share of interpretive challenges quite beyond those posed by the shifting rhythms and often densely metaphorical textures of Proust's prose. Carter's notes—424 of them in all—respond to this and are appended in a column on the outside margin of each page, like the voice of a knowledgeable friend who sits at our side as we read. Reading these notes reminds one of the sheer breadth and diversity of Proust's frame of reference. Carter mostly clarifies names of places and people as well as cultural-historical matters (there are notes, for instance, on "Nesselrode pudding," the term "gruppetto," and on the biographical details of all sorts of named notables), but he also uses notes to flag up points of critical interest, referencing the scholarly literature as he does so, and at times highlights internal echoes in the text, nudging his reader to remember this or that fact, name, or allusion, pointing backwards and forwards from the volume in hand. Critics of the Roger Shattuck school might argue that in this Carter goes too far, that these annotations edge into critical commentary and thus contribute to the tendency toward hypertrophy one finds in works devoted to Proust.[7] One suspects, however, that many readers will long be grateful for the light shed by these marginal pointers.

Beyond the complex task of annotation, Carter's job in this new edition is the painstaking business of re-reading, in parallel, Proust's original and Scott Moncrieff's English in order to strip out Moncrieff's not infrequent amplifications or elaborations. Take for example the following sentence, describing the early stages of the protagonist's first stay at Balbec and the ways in which his grandmother accommodates his insecurities in these new surroundings:

« Elle entrouvrant les persiennes ; à l'annexe en saillie de l'hôtel, le soleil était déjà installé sur les toits comme un couvreur matinal qui commence tôt son ouvrage et l'accomplit en silence pour ne pas réveiller la ville qui dort encore et de laquelle l'immobilité le fait paraître plus agile. »[8]

Here is Scott Moncrieff's rendering:

"She would push open the shutters, and where a wing of the hotel jutted out at right angles to my window, the sun would already have settled on the roof, like a slater who is up betimes, and starts early and works quietly so as not to rouse the sleeping town whose stillness makes him seem more agile." [9]

And Carter's:

"She would open the shutters; where a wing of the hotel jutted out at right angles to my window, the sun was already settled on the roof, like an early-rising roofer who begins early and works quietly in order not to awaken the sleeping town whose immobility makes him appear more agile" (p. 269).

Carter's is certainly more pared back, closer to Proust in a number of ways: the semi-colon is retained, no "and" is added to the following clause, the tense of "installer" is reinstated, the archaic "betimes" is excised, and "appear" brings us back a little closer to "paraître." "Early-rising" very successfully enfoldes the key elements of "matinal" and "qui commence tôt," without the fussiness (absent from the French) of Scott Moncrieff's "betimes." If Carter's revisions are to be criticised, we might note that in adjusting "slater," Carter introduces a repetition in his version with "roof"/"roofer" that is not present in the French. The examples from this short excerpt are usefully illustrative of Carter's practice throughout the volume (and, of course, in his *Swann's Way*, published in 2013).

At times, but by no means in all cases, where Scott Moncrieff has erred with the sense of a word or phrase, Carter provides a textual note to this effect; equally, at times he notes where he has kept an interpretive or amplificatory choice of Scott Moncrieff's and explains the literal sense of the original French. There are some decisions that seem odd or unexpected in a translation with the stated aim of restoring a sense of simplicity. Certain names, heard for the first time around the family dinner table, the Narrator suggests in characteristically associative vein, were for him "peut-être mélangés des extraits du goût des confitures, de l'odeur du feu de bois et du papier d'un livre de Bergotte" (*RTP*, II, p. 22). Carter curiously renders this as "in which were blended perhaps extracts of the flavour of confitures, the smell of the log fire and of the pages of Bergotte" (p. 261). "Confitures" stands out here as much as Moncrieff's "betimes" in the earlier example, where "jams" or "preserves" might be more readily expected. Yet this is not an instance of Carter carrying over his predecessor's idiosyncratic rendering. Moncrieff has "preserves" and Carter has chosen to change it. Given the thoroughness of Carter's approach, one imagines there is a good reason for this choice, but no note is given.

Another example illustrates the extent of the challenge posed to the translator of Proust's writing in *A l'ombre des jeunes filles en fleurs*. This is a volume brimming with energy and exhilaration, with the excitement of adolescent infatuation (with the *petite bande* and Albertine in particular), the discovery of art (with Elstir and his studio) and the visual and perceptual delights of public spaces and the great outdoors. The Narrator's description of the first appearance of the "jeunes filles" is instructive:

« Au milieu de tous ces gens dont quelques-uns poursuivaient une pensée, mais en trahissaient alors la mobilité par une saccade de gestes, une divagation de regards, aussi peu harmonieuses que la circonspecte titubation de leurs voisins, les fillettes que j'avais aperçues, avec la maîtrise de gestes que donne un parfait assouplissement de son propre corps et un mépris sincère du reste de l'humanité, venaient droit devant elles, sans hésitation ni raideur, exécutant exactement les mouvements qu'elles voulaient, dans une pleine indépendance de chacun de leurs membres par rapport aux autres, la plus grande partie de leur corps gardant cette immobilité si remarquable chez les bonnes valseuses » (*RTP*, II, p. 147).

This extraordinary sentence enacts, in the sinuous folds of its syntax and its carefully modulated rhythms, the remarkable interwoven movements that the narrator observes. And for the translator, its challenges are many. In the space available to me here I shall focus on a small number of issues of lexis in the first half of the sentence. Scott Moncrieff offers the following:

"In the midst of all these people, some of whom were pursuing a train of thought, but then betrayed its instability by a fitfulness of gesture, an aberrancy of gaze as inharmonious as the circumspect titubation of their neighbours, the girls whom I had noticed [...]" (Scott Moncrieff, p. 427).

And here is Carter's version:

"In the midst of all these people, some of whom were pursuing a train of thought, but then so betrayed its instability by saccadic gestures, a roving gaze as inharmonious as the circumspect titubation of their neighbors, the girls whom I had noticed [...]" (p. 402).

What is intriguing here is that Carter rejects "fitfulness of gesture," preferring "saccadic": a specialised adjective used in medical discourse to describe sudden or irregular movements. On the other hand, he rejects the formal, possibly medicalized overtones of "aberrancy," suggesting social unacceptability, to replace it with the more neutral "roving gaze," suggesting, perhaps, mere curiosity. Titubation is rare in both French and English, but one might expect the specificity of the diminutive "fillettes," flattened to "girls" by Scott Moncrieff, to be revised by Carter, particularly given the attention paid in this passage and the volume as a whole to the evolving appearance and identity of the members of the "petite bande."

Readers with a knowledge of French might find other such instances with which to cavil in Carter's edition, but such is the nature of translation. Overall what Carter has provided, in a large yet still comfortably readable format, is a text that bridges the gap in the English-language market between basic "reading editions" and the scholarly offerings until now available only to readers of French. In coupling his annotations to an updated version of Scott Moncrieff's translation, Carter's undertaking with Yale is likely to be the edition of choice for students of the novel in English and readers keen for a supportive framework for their endeavours for some years to come.

NOTES

[1] Philip Kolb, ed., *Correspondance de Marcel Proust*, ed. by Philip Kolb, 21 vols. (Paris: Plon, 1970-93); Alison Winton [Finch], *Proust's Additions: The Making of 'A la recherche du temps perdu'*, 2 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977); Anthony R. Pugh, *The Growth of À la recherche du temps perdu. A Chronological Examination of Proust's Manuscripts from 1909 to 1914*, 2 vols. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004). For the ongoing publication of the "cahiers," see <http://www.brepols.net/Pages/BrowseBySeries.aspx?TreeSeries=MPC> (accessed 17/05/2016).

[2] William C. Carter, ed., *The UAB Proust Symposium: In Celebration of the 75th Anniversary of Swann's Way (1913-1988)* (Birmingham, Al.: Summa Publications, 1989).

[3] William C. Carter, *The Proustian Quest* (New York: New York University Press, 1992).

[4] William C. Carter, *Proust in Love* (New Haven, Conn. and London: Yale University Press, 2006).

[5] Marcel Proust, *In Search of Lost Time*, trans. by C. K. Scott Moncrieff (except for *Time Regained*, trans. by Andreas Mayor and Terence Kilmartin, revised by Terence Kilmartin and D. J. Enright, 6 vols. [London: Vintage, 2000-2002]); Marcel Proust, *In Search of Lost Time*, ed. by Christopher Prendergast, trans. by Lydia Davis, James Grieve, Mark Treharne, John Sturrock, Carol Clark, Peter Collier and Ian Patterson, 6 vols. (London: Allen Lane/Penguin, 2002). For the most recent comparative analysis, see Michael Wood's essay "Translations" in Adam Watt, ed., *Marcel Proust in Context* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 230-40.

[6] Marcel Proust, *Swann's Way*, trans. by C. K. Scott Moncrieff, edited and annotated by William C. Carter (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2013), "Introduction," p. xi. Hereafter "*Swann*, Carter."

[7] See Roger Shattuck, "The Threat to Proust," *New York Review of Books*, 18 March 1999: accessible at <http://www.nybooks.com/articles/1999/03/18/the-threat-to-proust/> (accessed 17/05/2016).

[8] Marcel Proust, *A l'ombre des jeunes filles en fleurs*, in *A la recherche du temps perdu*, ed. by Jean-Yves Tadié, Bibliothèque de la Pléiade, 4 vols. (Paris: Gallimard, 1987-89), II, p. 30. Hereafter *RTP*.

[9] Marcel Proust, *Within a Budding Grove*, trans. by C. K. Scott Moncrieff and Terence Kilmartin, revised by D. J. Enright (London: Vintage, 2002), p. 285. Hereafter "Scott Moncrieff."

Adam Watt
University of Exeter
a.a.watt@ex.ac.uk

Copyright © 2016 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit

educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/ republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172