
H-France Review Vol. 15 (March 2015), No. 34

Yolanda Plumley, *The Art of Grafted Song. Citation and Allusion in the Age of Machaut*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2013. xxvi + 496 pp. 15 figures, 26 tables, 38 music examples, 62 poetry examples; notes, bibliography and indexes. \$74.00 U.S. (cl) ISBN: 9780199915088.

Review Maureen Boulton, University of Notre Dame.

Yolanda Plumley's book is a masterful study of one of the most important compositional techniques of lyric poetry (and music) in the fourteenth century, namely, that of building new works from material cited from other sources. She covers most of the century, from the beginnings of *ars nova* early in the century to the mature works of Guillaume de Machaut in the 1360s. The "grafted song" of the title refers to songs that incorporate citations from other songs and elaborate on the borrowed material. She defines "citational practice" broadly, including not only explicit quotation but also allusion and other kinds of modeling and imitation used consciously by poets and poet-composers. Her book charts varieties of borrowing (quotation, citation, allusion, paraphrase) and traces the networks of connections that they establish between authors or repertoires.

In contrast to most studies of fourteenth century lyric, which are usually either literary or musicological in emphasis, Plumley explores collections of lyrics both with and without notation, and also discusses pieces inserted into narratives (e.g., the *Roman de Fauvel*). In her analyses, she treats text as well as music (when it exists), and also considers the manuscript placement (*mise en page*) when that is relevant to the discussion. When lyrics have survived without any music, she assesses evidence that suggests that they might have originally been sung. For lyrics inserted into narratives, there are often references to them as songs, or descriptions of singing. In other cases, Plumley suggests that the presence in a musical piece (e.g., a motet) of lines borrowed from a lyric transmitted without music raises the possibility that its melody has been lost. These suggestions raise important questions about the too-frequent separation of lyric poetry from song, reminding musicologists that medieval repertoires were more extensive than those that survive, and literary scholars that they should be mindful of the musical dimension of medieval poetry.

Plumley explores the relation of musical pieces (particularly *Refrains*) that occur in other settings, and traces networks of borrowings where identical material occurs in three or more lyric poems. This work allows her to recreate communities of poets, *puy*s, court circles, or perhaps simply readers. In the final chapter, she adduces an impressive quantity of historical material to argue convincingly that Machaut's circle constituted a kind of *puy* associated with the Duke of Berry. Thus, she finds a continuing tradition of poetic engagement and competition through most of the fourteenth century.

The book's ten chapters are grouped into three parts. The first part (Citation, Genre, and Experiments in Song in the Early Fourteenth Century) opens with a study of the collection of *ballettes* in Oxford, Bodleian Library, Douce 308. This *chansonnier* records two types of *ballette*. In the more common type the refrain recurs at the end of each stanza, as it does in the *ars nova* ballade. In the other form, the refrain also occurs at the beginning of the poem in a manner that anticipates the *virelai*. After noting how the *ballettes* allude to older lyric genres, Plumley traces patterns of citation of refrains both within the *chansonnier* and externally in narrative works (e.g., the *Tournoi de Chauvenci* and *Renart le nouvel*) and in the motet repertory. In the former phenomenon, she sees, "a fascinating insight into the

compositional process and into how poet-composers built new works upon existing elements through an intricate process of variation and collage" (pp. 49-50). The remaining two chapters of this section are devoted to the works of Paris, BnF, fr. 146 (the so-called *Fauvel* manuscript): the works of Jehannot de Lescurel (chapter two) and the *Roman de Fauvel* (chapter three). She notes that Lescurel used refrains found in the Douce collection, and also that his work is linked by refrains shared with the lyrics inserted into the *Roman de Fauvel*. Plumley argues that musical portions of the *Fauvel* manuscript shed light on the repertoires in fashion in Paris court circles in the 1310s. Particularly interesting is her observation that "certain of the vernacular works in the *roman* involved an extensive and innovative kind of citational modeling, which implicated the listeners' intimate recollection of entire works, even sophisticated polyphonic ones, rather than simple, tuneful aphoristic snippets" (p. 120).

The second part (Performing Citation in Court and City: the Rise of the Fixed Forms) examines the different contexts in which citational lyrics were composed, ranging from formal literary competitions to princely courts. Chapter four studies Watriquet de Couvin's *fastras* or nonsense poems, which lack musical notation. Since many of the poet's borrowings come from sources that do have music, Plumley speculates (p. 142) that parts of these lyrics might have been sung, and notes (p. 144) an "implied or 'virtual' musicality" in the *fastras*. In making these suggestions, the author adduces a variety of types of evidence. She is to be commended for venturing beyond the obvious, even as she is careful to admit the limits of her suggestions. Chapter five, on the *puys* of Paris and Valenciennes (as represented in manuscripts Paris, BnF, fr. 24432, and BnF, fr. 819-20) describes the functioning of historical institutions that fostered the creation and performance of lyric repertoires, often through literary competitions. In chapter six, Plumley examines works with lyric insertions (the *Parfait du Paon* and the *Regret Guillaume*) by the rather neglected poet Jehan de Le Mote, whose patrons included a queen (Philippa of Hainaut) and merchants of the goldsmiths' guild. Noting relationships between Le Mote's lyrics and those of Guillaume de Machaut, Plumley suggests (p. 212) that they might result from the poets' participation in literary competitions such as those described in chapter five. Chapter seven focuses on a group of six mythological ballades written ca. 1350 by Le Mote, Philippe de Vitry, and Jehan Campion, as an example of what she terms (p. 253) "a collaborative composition of sequences of interrelated lyrics." Here again, although this group is transmitted without music, Plumley discusses evidence that suggests that both Campion and Le Mote were composers as well as poets.

Part Three (Machaut and the Art of Grafted Song) is perhaps the most important section of the book, for it places Guillaume de Machaut's lyric practice into the broader context of grafting and citational practice examined in the earlier parts of the book. In chapter eight ("Machaut's Heritage: Tracing Citations in his Lyrics and Songs"), Plumley surveys briefly Machaut's use of proverbs and older *trouvère* songs before highlighting connections between his ballades (both with and without music) and the lyrics of Douce 308. Chapter nine ("Self-Citation and Lyric Process in *La Loange des dames*") examines the intratextual play--the repetition of lines and phrases--that is a striking characteristic of this lyric collection. The poems linked by recurring lines and phrases range from widely separated pairs to sequences juxtaposed in the manuscript arrangement, and are the subject of extended analysis and sensitive readings. Given the rarity of linked sequences, however, Plumley concludes that Machaut was generally "content to conceive his lyrics as individual entities" (p. 336). The final chapter ("The Dynamics of Duplication. Staging Debate in Machaut's *Voir Dit*") is devoted to his late narrative poem containing seventy lyric insertions (some taken from the *Loange*), many of which form paired exchanges between the narrator and his lady, Toubelle. Plumley concentrates most of her analysis on the lyrics that have musical settings, demonstrating that Machaut employed allusions and citations in his musical compositions just as he did in his unaccompanied lyrics. Much of the chapter (pp. 367-77) is devoted to a pair of lyrics, a ballade by Thomas Païen and a response to it by Machaut, who also composed a setting (B34) incorporating both texts. In the final section of the chapter (pp. 377-400), Plumley uses a case-study of this ballade as a means of identifying members of "Machaut's circle," that is, poets and poet-composers who knew and responded to each other's work. The analyses in the Machaut chapters amply demonstrate that the great poet-composer, for all his debt to the citational techniques of the earlier

poets studied in the book, brought the "grafted song" to new heights, and inspired younger contemporaries and successors to imitate him.

I found little to quibble with in this book. The article, "The Serventois" by Rosenberg referred to on p. 164 n. 41, does not seem to be listed in the bibliography. The dating of the manuscript Paris, BnF, NAF 6221 (p. 225 "soon after 1400") seems somewhat misleading. Since the manuscript contains pieces composed c. 1416 and 1418, a dating of c. 1420 or later would be more accurate. In the literary discussions, I was occasionally frustrated that there is little analysis of how alterations in the cited material itself, or in its new context might affect the meaning. However, as Plumley reasonably explains in the Introduction (p. 13), the relationships between songs are usually highlighted as illustrations of links between poets, their sources, or their contexts. Thus, she has left for others to explore the literary ramifications of these links. There is much fascinating material, and Plumley has opened the way for other scholars to explore more fully parallels that she could not develop here.

These minor points do not detract from the overall excellence of this study. Yolanda Plumley's *The Art of Grafted Song* is a tour de force of musical and literary analysis. Throughout the book, the musical descriptions and analyses are clear and illuminating. Literary scholars should not be intimidated by the number of musical examples: the discussions are accessible to non-musicologists (at least, this one), and I think that anyone with a reasonable ability to read music will be able to understand the arguments. The musical analysis complements and enriches the literary analysis. Plumley's refusal to exclude from consideration lyrics that currently lack music is a salutary reminder that the current boundary between lyrics with and without music is an artificial modern construct. This will be essential reading for scholars of medieval French music and poetry alike, and will shape the discussion of late medieval lyric poetry for many years to come.

Maureen Boulton
University of Notre Dame
mboulton@nd.edu

Copyright © 2015 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/ republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172