

---

H-France Review Vol. 10 (April 2010), No. 65

Jean-Robert Pitte, *Bordeaux/Burgundy: A Vintage Rivalry* (Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: The University of California Press, 2008). Originally published as *Bordeaux Bourgogne: Les passions rivales* (Paris: Éditions Hachette, 2005), translated by M. B. DeBevoise. xiv + 246 pp. Maps, notes, bibliography and index. \$ 24.95 U.S. (cl). ISBN 978-0-24940-0.

Review by Philip Whalen, Coastal Carolina University.

In a field frequently dominated by the pronouncements of gurus, oenologists, vintners, pundits, wine experts and self-styled amateurs of radically diverging opinion and expertise, Jean-Robert Pitte's treatment of the history of the Bordeaux and Burgundy wine industries comes across as restrained and diplomatic. His book is not calculated "to provoke or settle scores" but is designed instead, the author signals early on, "to sharpen the critical spirit" (p. xii). To that end, the English language edition of *Bordeaux Bourgogne: Les passions rivales* (2005) begins with a tale of "two brothers" who represent "opposite civilizations" (p. xii) and "show little more than disdain for each other" (p. xiv). Professor Pitte, of course, has a rather more ambitious agenda and messier terrain to cover. His historical overview of the geography, culture and economy of French winemaking along with the evolution of consumer tastes is calculated to make the brothers Bordeaux and Burgundy, their extended family of enthusiasts, and the French wine industry realize that this rivalry is really a "shared passion for excellence" (p. xiii) that entails analogous practices and shared challenges in the present era of international competition, blind tastings, climate change, and technological development: "It would be a shame if French viticulturalists were not to profit from all the wonderful contributions of new technologies, which do not in the least prevent them from expressing their own personality in the wines they make. It would be a still greater shame, however, if these modern methods were used to standardize their wines with a view to imitating certain styles currently popular in North America and the southern hemisphere. In that unfortunate event, the whole of French viticulture would soon disappear" (p. 174).

Pitte's "Introduction" identifies the natural and human elements that structure his investigation of the development of *terroir* in Bordeaux and Burgundy.[1] These include the relative influences of geology, climate, biology, cultural preference, technological developments, emerging markets, and evolving consumer tastes (right down to their "cloned taste buds," p. 11) that have contributed to the making of quality wines in modern France. *Bordeaux/Burgundy: A Vintage Rivalry* moves beyond the current obsession with (in)famous wine tastings (there it is again--Paris, 1976!) to address how the French have used technology (broadly defined to include the vintner's *savoir faire* or "soundness of judgment") to manipulate natural factors in order to create the quality wines consumers demand, or at least purchase (p. 51). The recent film *Mondovino* (2005) serves to bring a long-running and often heated debate between traditionalists and globalists into focus. The film contrasts those who, like film's director Jonathan Nossiter, believe that the vectors of globalization combined with the influence of wine gurus such as Robert Parker and/or winemaking business consultants such as Michel Rolland have had the negative effect of homogenizing wine aromas and flavors (which have the consequence of "reducing diversity and encouraging production technologies that mask 'terroir'") against the assertions of those very same experts (such as Eric Asimov as well as Parker and Rolland) who argue instead that wine

quality has improved steadily and that today's markets offer more desired quality and variety than in the past.<sup>[2]</sup>

A short first chapter ("Weighing the Evidence") briefly indulges in stereotypes about the "two impenetrable worlds" of Bordeaux and Burgundy that infrequently condescend to drink each other's wines (p. 10). This narrative conflates Burgundian laborers and vintners into "food loving peasants, whose hands are always calloused and deformed by manual labor" but nonetheless have "large piles of money" that they spend on "expensive cars like so many vulgar nouveau riches" (p. 6). The Bordelais winemakers, by contrast, are characterized as austere aristocrats who drink their bold Gironde wines out of carafes and are notoriously stingy during wine-tastings (p. 9). Pitte exploits these purposefully overblown characterizations in order to stage his subsequent comparison of these rival regions with more subtle, comparative cultural, economic, historical and geographic perspectives.

The second chapter, "Markets and Consumer," introduces readers to scholarship concerned with the influence of taste(s) and markets on shaping the quality of wines produced. The significance of this exposition is that it does not reduce the factors that make good wine while recognizing their importance as either reductively determined by the operations of the natural elements (such as soil or climate) or by the vintner's techniques (*viti/viniculture*) (p. 17). Pitte champions and credits Roger Dion's famous thesis concerning the role of markets in the development of quality wines in France.<sup>[3]</sup> "As scandalous as it may seem," Pitte writes, "the essential component of the land consists of taste buds, pleasures, and purchasing power, in a word, the consumer" (p. 14). He adds that the idea of placing such an emphasis on the role of markets driven by consumers was originally advanced by Roger Dion (qualified as "the foremost authority on the history and geography of winemaking in France") nearly half a century ago. Dion's thesis, Pitte argues, "seems sounder today than ever" (p. 14). It also provides the springboard for Pitte's overview of how French winemakers in Bordeaux and Burgundy from the Gallo-Roman period through the twentieth century have responded to different market forces as much as to local climates and conditions. Having observed that "[w]ines that blend power and finesse can be achieved only by very deliberate efforts on the part of winemakers," Pitte argues that their labor is expensive and must therefore be "performed only in response to a demanding and wealthy clientele" (p. 48).

A key pivotal period in the development of France's wine industries, according to Pitte, was the late Middle Ages, when an increased international demand for French wines shifted consumption, and therefore production, away from local and regional tastes to international markets and tastes instead. He notes how Bordelais wines benefited from maritime trade (carried by Bretons, Basques and Saintongeais traders) to the English, the Dutch and the Antilles. England's King John's decision in 1241 to exempt Bordelais wines from customary taxes created a lasting relationship that would influence the region's selection of grapes and the kinds of wines it produced (p. 36). Pitte also describes how overland links between the Dukes of Burgundy and Flemish cities and the routes along Burgundy's waterways to Paris similarly influenced the development of quality wines in that province: "[t]he physical environment mattered," he writes, "but producers, and especially their customers and the merchants who supplied these customers, mattered still more" (p. 37). He then traces the development of the Clos Vougeot and the Romané-Conti vineyards across several centuries to describe the influence of trade on the production of wines calculated to address the tastes of purchasers. Indeed, Pitte acknowledges that tastes are largely "presumed" (p. 59) on the basis of trade. One of the problems in this equation is how the tastes of consumers, in the first instance, are translated into demand for particular wines. As Pitte's illustrative examples come from research conducted by other scholars, he neither attempts to quantify the demand himself nor speculate beyond well-accepted trends about who were the ultimate purchasers of exported Bordeaux and Burgundies.<sup>[4]</sup> Research on the history of the production and consumption of particular products often reveals that consumer demand is frequently manufactured by those invested in selling a given product or commodity.<sup>[5]</sup>

Pitte's survey builds on two generations of late twentieth-century scholarship on the history and geography of French wine production and the wine trade. His narrative leans heavily on the works of Roger Dion, Marcel Lachiver, Gilbert Garrier, Henri Enjalbert, and Jean-François Bazin.[6] While providing a convenient synthesis of French scholarship for the book's intended audience of English readers, scholars will note the relative absence of non-French scholarship in Bordeaux/Burgundy: A Vintage Rivalry. The few exceptions are works by Tim Unwin, Clive Coates, Mark Holt, and Hugh Johnson, mostly from early 1990s. Only one article from the eminently respectable Journal of Wine Research is cited. Recent works, such as that of Pierre Spahni on the selection of grape varieties in response to markets, would lend additional support to Pitte's arguments.[7] This does not deter the author from launching into wide-ranging, judicious and frequently entertaining (despite the gender-specific jokes which Anglo audiences might not appreciate) introduction to the subject of the relationship between markets and the development of quality wines in France (and yes, Pitte does admit that the wines were not all always very good).

Although relying in large part on existing scholarship, this chapter has the merit of synthesizing materials on the eighteenth century absent, for instance, in Tim Unwin's deservedly popular and more global *Wine and the Vine: An Historical Geography of Viticulture and the Wine Trade*. [8] Pitte's book thus provides a balanced introduction to the range of issues related to notions of quality that link the histories of wine and trade. [9] Questions remain concerning the correlation between taste and demand that would have been usefully addressed and easily worked into the author's anecdotal style. What, for example, were the indicators used to gauge the qualities of wine? Did those who purchased wine drink it themselves? Were some wines stored longer than others, thereby throwing off comparisons based on annual demand? Might the wines have been purchased for resale, gifts, or stocking cellars in properties or estates at other locations? Did the distances transported and modes of transportation (in wooden casks) employed reduce the amount of wine actually delivered? Which wines were purchased for mixing? Did prices, then as now, influence consumer perceptions of quality and therefore demand?

Widely known for his recent presidency of the University of Paris-IV (Sorbonne) from 2003 to 2008, Pitte is the current President of the Société de géographie de Paris (established in 1831), the Co-Director of the Festival international de géographie (FIG), and (here is a job to make gourmets and gourmands everywhere salivate...!) the President of the Mission Française du Patrimoine et des Cultures Alimentaires, whose mission includes, among others, the task of convincing UNESCO to recognize gastronomic France as a world heritage site. He remains foremost, for those unfamiliar with his professional cursus, a highly esteemed Professor of Geography at the Sorbonne. [10] So it is appropriate that the third chapter shifts the discussion from economic to geographic factors related to the production of quality wines. This section squarely challenges the popularly (religiously, for some) held belief "that the established hierarchy of classed wines is intrinsic to an immutable, definitive geography, and that nothing can ever be done about it" (p. 58). "Although it is accepted today that great wines are born of the most 'natural' processes possible," Pitte assures the reader that little prevents them "from being tempered like the clavier of Johann Sebastian Bach" (p. 90) with, frequently, an unfortunate result comparable to the overuse of MSG in "bad Chinese cooking" or the face of "a woman who wears too much make-up" (p. 91).

Addressing the scholarship of a previous era, especially that of Rolande Gadille on Burgundy and René Pijassou on Bordeaux, Pitte loudly rejects hints of determinism in their explanations as "silly." [11] Recognizing that "the natural facts do seem to explain established hierarchy of terroirs" within a wine-producing region, he explains the extent to which terroirs are managed spaces. Drained, replanted, pruned, fertilized (including urban waste, p. 193), and genetically selected, such lands "have throughout their history," Pitte notes, "been substantially improved in ways that are mostly artificial in nature" (p. 73). Arguing against overt, pseudo or crypto-geographic determinisms – ("[t]here is no inevitability at work here")—he points to the existence of underworked terroirs and areas of "dull polyculture" that contrast dramatically with successful areas in which winemakers have skillfully defied traditions and/or

embraced new developments, such as warming trends (p. 69). Among the examples given, the Bourgogne Hautes-Côtes-de-Beaune, Bourgogne Hautes-Côtes-de-Nuits (p. 61) and Graves (“where no one had thought [it] possible”) would be familiar to most readers (p. 73).<sup>[12]</sup> Indeed, given the influence of variables ranging from natural conditions to winemaking preferences by way of cultivation methods, Pitte discovers “[n]o clear conclusion” concerning terroir’s destiny (p. 81). This lingering uncertainty leads Matt Kramer, for instance, to embrace a broad, if vague, set of bio-physical, technological and cultural factors that constitute terroir’s influence on wine-making. He argues that “[i]f only by process of elimination, the source must be ascribed to terroir. But to acknowledge this requires a belief that the ambiguous – the unprovable and immeasurable—can be real.”<sup>[13]</sup> What follows are varying philosophical beliefs and preferred practices concerning the nature and practice of terroir. These differences are abundantly and clearly articulated in Jacky Rigaud’s fifty interviews of winegrowers and professionals (primarily Burgundian with a few Bordelais and others) collected in *Le Terroir et le Vigneron* (translated by Catherine du Toit and Naomi Morgan as *Terroir & the Winegrower* (Clémency: Terre en vues, 2006). These voices find expression in Pitte’s even-tempered overview.

Triangulating between bio-physical and climatic conditions, evolving technological potential, and the human ego’s desire to create, Pitte’s fourth chapter, “Incomparable Wines,” touches on a range of symbolic, discursive, cognitive, affective, and visceral practices that have served to anchor regional wine-making identities in the geography of terroir. This cultural detour shows just how rich are the practices, customs, traditions, and folklore (ranging from preferences for wine bottle shapes and varietal preferences to the shapes of vineyards in different regions and Gaston Roupnel’s florid descriptions of the Côte-d’Or and the Clos Vougeot’s vineyards) that constitute the rich cultural histories of these spaces (pp. 137 and 145). Pitte’s history of terroir’s pragmatic practitioners and advocates (“the soundness and judgment of the winemaker” (p. 51)) and the role of trial and error in discovering incremental improvements in viticultural methods in, according to Pitte, response to consumer demand (p. 29) – retains, in the end, something mythical and spectacular (“wine is above all an expression of life on earth,” p. 175). Kollen Guy has previously noted how the discourse (she refers to the ideology) of terroir has provided the French with a powerful and protean discourse denoting the indicators of quality and authenticity.<sup>[14]</sup> Terroir simultaneously serves as a stable set of geo-spatial conditions, a human practices and the final expression (in the form of wine) of successful winemaking. This field of knowledge served the French wine industry for most of the twentieth century. Gaston Gérard, France’s first Under-Secretary of Tourism in 1931 and the visionary mayor of Dijon (1921-1936) who launched Dijon’s Gastronomical Fair, understood its protean potential when he argued that Burgundians should “Fight, not for quality nor prices [...] but for the field of quality” (“Ne luttons pas [...] sur la qualité ni sur les prix, mais luttons sur le terrain de la qualité qui est le nôtre”).<sup>[15]</sup> He was roundly understood and supported. The struggle today, if would appear, is no longer whether to accept or reject the application of the concept of terroir to the French wine industry (it was in fact extended to cover other agricultural products in France in the 1990s) but what to include or exclude in that definition<sup>[15.5]</sup>.

Because of the variability (in addition to natural causes) introduced by cultural factors—ranging from controlled harvesting (or biodynamique harvesting under the correct conditions, clothing optional) or monitored yeast autolysis (decomposing) to vinifications technologically administered by university trained oenologists, to dégustations (wine tastings) performed under appropriate conditions, or price setting through wine auctions held in traditional settings (as in the annual auction held in Beaune)—one might wonder how it is that “local, fair and constant” practices required for AOC (Appellation d’origine contrôlée) certification reliably ensue? In fact, France has long fought against fraudulent practices in the wine industry to “avoid confusion in the public’s mind,” allow consumers to discern the quality of wines, and hold producers liable for the contents.<sup>[16]</sup> This is one of the principal functions of wine labels. Pitte makes note of “appalling” microvinifications, cryoextraction, reverse osmosis, overchaptalization, artificial fermentations, doctoring techniques, “the laziness and greed of certain merchants” (p. 100), infamous scandals in Bordeaux and Burgundy through the twentieth century (pp. 93 and 102), and “the methods of certain viticulturists in North America and the southern hemisphere,

whose unrivalled mastery has allowed them to bring doctored wines to market at affordable prices” (p. 91). This is an important problem that can undermine every aspect of wine, from production to reputation. It is, for better or worse—and, Jean-Robert Pitte would prefer an informed and educated practice—likely to continue.[17]

The factors that contribute to the making of wine (whatever the quality and with rare exceptions being for discrete events, such as the annual feast of Saint Vincent in Burgundy) are theoretically reflected on wine bottle *étiquettes* (labels). They provide information about the contents provenance and maker. Complicating this formula is the fact that the French employ it through regional vernaculars. So, in addition to identifying a “maker” and the location where the contents were bottled (but not necessarily by whom), the mechanisms of legal and political compromise have been employed to translate regional practices into different equations.[18] The Institut national de l’origine et de la qualité (L’INAO) has adopted four principle methods for identifying and regulating French wines: *terroir* in Burgundy; estates (property) in Bordeaux; *marque* (manufacturer) in Champagne; and varietals in Alsace. Consequently, the wine labels—which ought theoretically to reduce the entirety of the discourse concerning the elements that have gone into the making of a wine into a recognizable idiom and consensual practice, sometimes function more as looking glasses through which makers and consumers can easily lose sight of one another. Consider, as Elizabeth Barham explains, how “labeling practices reflect a negotiated compromise between market forces and the rhetoric of place in order to regulated who, where, how and what may be produced in the agro-business of wine” (p. 136). [19]

Efforts, regulated in France but not necessarily everywhere else, to produce different labels have produced both fanciful and informative results, but not typically both at the same time. Fortunately, felicitous innovations exist. Those, for example, invested in showing winemaking to be a scientifically rigorous process might consider how their perspective is marketed in the United States. A 2006 Estate Pinot Noir from the Willamette Valley Vineyard located in Turner, Oregon, for example, provides a wealth of technical information beyond the customary proprietor, varietal and vineyard (or, elsewhere, the legally required) on its label. It reveals the Pinot Noir clone types (Pommard, Wadenswil, and Dijon (667 and 777); soil type (rich volcanic); the harvest date (Sept. 30- October 15, 2006); the brix at harvest (24.1-26.8 degrees/ a measure of sugar content); Resveratrol (3.5 micromolar); the barrel regimen (12 months in French oak); the percentage and type of new oak (20 percent Allier Forest); as well as peak drinkability period (2008-2012). This information, dare I say it, may be more useful for consumers looking for the markers of consistent quality than is customarily or necessarily provided on French wine labels (*étiquettes*). Pitte acknowledges that the labeling practices of wine merchants are not always exact (p. 120). Another Willamette Valley Pinot Noir, a 2007 from the Anne and Amie Estates, additionally includes information about the vineyards from which the blended wines originated, reflecting the practice of blending wines belonging to the same proprietor(s) but grown in different locations.

“Despite the twists and turns in the dispute,” Jeffrey Iverson has recently pointed out, “a minirevolution is taking place in the French wine industry. Some wine makers argue that the French have for too long clung to a romanticized notion of *terroir* and a convoluted labeling system, the *appellation d’origine contrôlée* (AOC), which makes it difficult for consumers to figure out that a Domaine des Comtes Lafon Volnay Santenots-du-Milieu Premiere Cru is a Burgundy wine—let alone a pinot noir.”[20]

To conclude; *Bordeaux/Burgundy: A Vintage Rivalry* provides a rapid and well-informed, comparative guide to two of France’s most important wine producing regions. In addition to obtaining a heightened understanding of the role of consumer tastes and market demand on the production and circulation of quality wines, readers will learn that the good vineyard management in France and elsewhere “consists in choosing the right combination, and in some cases the particular grape variety, that will make it possible...to realize the virtues of the soil and the microclimate as fully as possible” (p. 50).[21] While much of the material that Pitte considers is in fact familiar, his comparative perspective and balanced

exposition reveal just how complex and interrelated are the histories and practices shared by Bordeaux and Burgundy. By daring to discuss the merits and demerits of each neighbor's woodpile, as it were, Pitte manages to cover treacherous terrain to offer sound advice for winemakers, wine spectators, and lovers of terroir (p. 175). Celebrating difference over invariance, Pitte invites winemakers to abandon "the belief in the intrinsic value of grands terroirs" and place their faith, instead, in better selection through ingenuity and talent (p. 174).

## NOTES

[1] Matt Kramer defines *terroir* as "everything that contributes to the distinction of a vineyard" in *Making Sense of Burgundy* (New York: W. Morrow, 1990, 39-40). James E. Wilson defines *terroir* as "the totality of the elements of the vineyard habitat." Acknowledging "the true concept is not easily grasped but includes physical elements of the vineyard habitat, the vine, subsoil, site, drainage and microclimate" (p. 326), Wilson also includes *terroir's* spiritual dimensions: "beyond the measurable ecosystem [...] the spiritual aspect that recognizes the joys, the heartbreaks, the pride, the sweat and the frustrations of its history (pp. 55-56)" in *Terroir: The Role of Geology, Climate, and Culture in the Making of French Wines* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).

[2] See, Tony Lima and Norma Schroder, "Jonathan Nossiter (Director): *Mondovino*," *Journal of Wine Economics* 4.1 (2009): 119. Available at <[http://www.wineconomics.org/journal/content/Volume4/number1/Full%20Texts/9\\_wine%20economics\\_vol%204\\_1\\_Book%20Reviews.pdf](http://www.wineconomics.org/journal/content/Volume4/number1/Full%20Texts/9_wine%20economics_vol%204_1_Book%20Reviews.pdf)> (accessed June 4, 2009), Eric Asimov, "Satan or Savior: Setting the Grape Standard," *New York Times*, October 11, 2006, and Olivier Torrès, *La Guerre des vins: l'affaire Mondavi, mondialisation et terroirs* (Paris, 2005), and, for example, Dan Berger on "The Collapse of Cabernet" [http://www.napavalleyregister.com/lifestyles/food-and-cooking/wine/columnists/dan-berger/article\\_704bc688-0712-11df-a231-001cc4c002e0.html](http://www.napavalleyregister.com/lifestyles/food-and-cooking/wine/columnists/dan-berger/article_704bc688-0712-11df-a231-001cc4c002e0.html) (accessed January 20, 2010).

[3] Pitte notes that this was anticipated by *agronomes* such as Olivier de Serre in *Théâtre d'agriculture* as early as in 1601.

[4] The essentials are outlined in overviews such as Pierre Goubert's *The Course in French History* (New York: Routledge, 1988 [1984]): 161.

[5] Sidney Mintz's work on the Atlantic sugar economy is a case in point. Those investing in the plantation complex were most concerned to see that the British acquired a taste for sweets. See, Sidney Mintz, *Sweetness and Power: The Place of Sugar in Modern History*, (New York: Viking, 1985). The advertisement copy and graphics in Raymond Badouin's early twentieth-century *Revue du Vin de France* illustrates the marketing aspect of the wine production-consumption nexus in operation, including numerous articles extolling the health benefits of wine versus beer or hard alcohols (see, Docteur René Guillermin, "Le vin et la médecine," *Revue du Vin de France* 119 (1937): 8-9) and editorials in *Vin de France* advocating teaching responsible wine consumption in schools in order to ward off addictions to more "nefarious" substances in André Farge, "La Propagande vinicole dans l'enseignement," (*Revue du Vin de France* 36 (July 1930): 8-9).

Quantification studies on taste abound. Recent essays addressing the perception and quantification of wine quality presented by the American Association of Wine Economists, to cite a readily available example, include, among others: Hadj, Lecocq and Wiser, "The Impact of Gurus: Parker Guides and EN PRIMEUR Wine Prices" AAW Working Paper No. 1; Gergaud and Ginsburgh, "Natural Endowments, Production Technologies, and the Quality of Wines in Bordeaux. Is it possible to produce wine on paved roads?" AAW Working Paper No. 2 "Do Fluctuations in Wine Stocks Affect Wines Prices" to Goldstein, Almenberg, Dreber, Herschkowisch and Katz, "Do more expensive wines taste

better?" AAWWE Working Paper No. 16; J. Almenberg and A. Dreber, "When does the price affect the taste?" AAWWE Working Paper No. 35; Heffetz and Shayo, "How Large are Non-Budget-Constraint Effects of Process on Demand" AAWWE Working Paper No. 39; or Crozet, Head and Mayer, "Quality Sorting and Trade: Firm Level Evidence for French Wine" AAWWE Working Paper No. 40.

[6] Including but not limited to: Roger Dion, *La Création du vignoble bordelais* (1952) and *Histoire de la vigne et du vin en France des origines au XIX<sup>ème</sup> siècle* (Paris: Flammarion, 1959), Marcel Lachiver, *Vins, vignes, vigneron. Histoire du vignoble français* (Paris: Fayard, 1988), Gilbert Garrier, *Histoire sociale et culturelle du vin* (Paris: Larousse-Bordas, 1998), Henri Enjalbert, *Histoire de la vigne et du vin: L'avènement de la qualité* (Paris: Bordas, 1975), Jean-François Bazin, *Histoire du vin de Bourgogne* (Paris: Gisserot, 2002), *Chambertin: La Côte de Nuits de Dijon à Chambolle-Musigny* (Paris: Jacques Legrand, 1991), and *Le Clos Vougeot* (Paris: Jacques Legrand, 1987).

[7] Pierre Spahni, *The International Wine Trade* (Cambridge: Woodhead Publishing, 2000).

[8] Tim Unwin, *Wine and the Vine: An Historical Geography of Viticulture and the Wine Trade* (London: Routledge, 1991). Unwin's book also illustrates a more effective use of maps, graphs and other data to supplement and support the main narrative.

[9] Recent works on the French wine trade during the early modern period such as John V. C. Nye's *War, Wine, and Taxes: The Political Economy of Anglo-French Trade, 1689-1900* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007), Henriette de Bruyn Kops's *A Spirited Exchange: The Wine and Brandy Trade Between France and the Dutch Republic in its Atlantic Framework, 1600-1650* (Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2007), or those related to globalization such as Andy Smith, Jacques de Maillard and Olivier Costa's *Vin et politique: Bordeaux, la France, la mondialisation* (Paris: Les Presses de Sciences, 2007) – published after the French edition but before the English translation of *Bordeaux/Burgundy* – attest to the value of examining the French wine industry within the context of international trade.

[10] Among his numerous publications, J.-R. Pitte has notably authored a *Histoire du paysage français. 2 vols.* (Paris: Éditions Talladier, 1983) and *French Gastronomy: The History and Geography of a Passion* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002). He has also edited a collection of essays by Roger Dion on wine entitled *Le paysage et la vigne* (Paris: Payot, 2004); written a 700-page, *Le désir du vin: à la conquête du monde* (Paris: Fayard, 2009) and *A la table des Dieux* 2009 (Paris: Fayard, 2009), edited *Les frontières alimentaires* (Paris, CNRS, 2009) with Massimo Montanari; as well as a forthcoming edition of essays related to Roger Dion's legacy in the field of wine research.

[11] Rolande Gadille, *Le vignoble de Bourgogne: Fondements physique et humains d'une viticulture de haute qualité* (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1967) and René Pijassou, *Un grand vignoble de qualité: Le Médoc, 2 vols.* (Paris: Tallandier, 1980).

[12] Interesting discussions of the role of geology (subsoil and soils) in winemaking may be found, among others, in: Robert White, *Soils for Fine Wines*, (London: Oxford University Press, 2003); geologist James Wilson, *Terroir: The Role of Geology, Climate, and Culture in the Making of French Wines* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999); Brian Sommers, *The Geography of Wine: How Landscapes, Cultures, Terroir, and the Weather Make a Good Drop* (New York: Plume Books, 2008) and Alex Maltman, "The Role of Vineyard Geology in Wine Typicity," *Journal of Wine Research* 19.1 (2008): 1-17.

[13] Matt Kramer, "The Notion of *Terroir*," in Fritz Allhoff (ed.), *Wine and Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007): 228.

[14] Kolleen Guy, "Rituals of Pleasure in the Land of Treasures: Wine Consumption and the Making of French Identity in the Late Nineteenth Century," in Warren Belasco and Philip Scranton, eds., *Food Nations: Selling Taste in Consumer Societies* (New York: Routledge, 2002), 39-44.

[15] Gaston Gérard, *La Terre de Bourgogne* 13 March 1932, pp. 166-67.

[15.5] A winemaker from the Loire was recently banned, by an Australian court, from selling a blended wine -- without appellation or appeal to the notion of *terroir* -- under the label Kiwi Cuvée in Australia. Others continue to export to such "easy drinking" blends around the world. In the meantime, a French wine called Arrogant Frog and produced by the Domaine Paul Mas "has become Australia's biggest French import." See, Jeffrey Iverson, "French wines learn New World marketing and branding" *TIME*, [http://news.yahoo.com/s/time/20100119/wl\\_time/08599195457100](http://news.yahoo.com/s/time/20100119/wl_time/08599195457100), (accessed 19 January 2010).

[16] Raymond Badouin in *La Revue du vin de France* 114 (1937): 11.

[17] Arguing for variance and diversity, Pitte reveals himself open to new technologies (p. 175). It may also be argued that it is actually quite difficult to make a bad wine with the technology and expertise available today. On winemaking's potential and the fate of *terroir* in an era of global technologies and phenomena, see Olivier Torrès, *La Guerre des vins: l'affaire Mondavi, mondialisation et terroirs* (Paris: Dunod, 2004), Michael White, Gregory Jones, and Philip Whalen, "Land and Wine," *Nature Geoscience* 2 (February, 2009): 82-84, and Jeffrey Iverson's recent departures including irrigation ("a practice forbidden in quality French vineyards, but permitted by the National Appellations Institute (INAO) in 2009 for several southern appellations") and "winemakers [...] doctoring their cuvées in order to maintain acidity levels" in "COP15: Climate-Change Conference," *TIME* (3 December 2009) available at [http://www.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,1929071\\_1929070\\_1945282,00.html](http://www.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,1929071_1929070_1945282,00.html) (last accessed 14 December 2009).

[18] Pitte might have said more about these practices. More familiar with Burgundy, I would point readers to important scholarship by the following authors: Robert Laurent, Loïc Abric, Christine Lamarre, Jean Bart, Elianne Lochot, Olivier Jacquet, François Legouy, Patrice Beck, Jérôme Sirdey, Annie Bleton-Ruget, Jean-François Bazin, Jean Vigreux, Roger Dubrion, Marion Demossier, Claude Chapuis, Gilles Lafferté, and Christophe Lucand.

[19] Elizabeth Barham, "Translating Terroir: The Global Challenge of French AOC labeling" *Journal of Rural Studies* 19 (2003): 127-138, esp. 136.

[20] In "How Global Warming Could Change the Winemaking Map," <[http://www.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,1929071\\_1929070\\_1945282,00.html](http://www.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,1929071_1929070_1945282,00.html)>

[21] It is interesting to note that Pitte has little to say about organic wines or wine making in other countries. This is particularly important, as capital, expertise and managerial skills do not confine themselves to one region or country at a time. On the first, consider Jean-François Bazin's *Le Vin bio, mythe our réalité* (Paris: Hachette, 2003). This reviewer is guessing that Pitte's two recent books on wine (see note 10 above) may provide a more global aperçu.

Philip Whalen  
Coastal Carolina University  
[pwhalen@coastal.edu](mailto:pwhalen@coastal.edu)

Copyright © 2010 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for redistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172